

## Renaissance and Reformation Renaissance et Réforme



### Caravale, Giorgio. *Preaching and Inquisition in Renaissance Italy: Words on Trial*. Trans. Frank Gordon

Christopher F. Black

Volume 40, numéro 4, automne 2017

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1086077ar>

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.33137/rr.v40i4.29279>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

Éditeur(s)

Iter Press

ISSN

0034-429X (imprimé)

2293-7374 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

Citer ce compte rendu

Black, C. (2017). Compte rendu de [Caravale, Giorgio. *Preaching and Inquisition in Renaissance Italy: Words on Trial*. Trans. Frank Gordon]. *Renaissance and Reformation / Renaissance et Réforme*, 40(4), 190-192.  
<https://doi.org/10.33137/rr.v40i4.29279>

© Canadian Society for Renaissance Studies / Société canadienne d'études de la Renaissance; Pacific Northwest Renaissance Society; Toronto Renaissance and Reformation Colloquium; Victoria University Centre for Renaissance and Reformation Studies, 2017

Ce document est protégé par la loi sur le droit d'auteur. L'utilisation des services d'Érudit (y compris la reproduction) est assujettie à sa politique d'utilisation que vous pouvez consulter en ligne.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/fr/usagers/politique-dutilisation/>

é  
rudit

Cet article est diffusé et préservé par Érudit.

Érudit est un consortium interuniversitaire sans but lucratif composé de l'Université de Montréal, l'Université Laval et l'Université du Québec à Montréal. Il a pour mission la promotion et la valorisation de la recherche.

<https://www.erudit.org/fr/>

important aspect of their everyday lived realities. Seasoned scholars and non-specialists alike will find much of value in his work.

CHRISTINA MOSS

University of Waterloo

**Caravale, Giorgio.**

***Preaching and Inquisition in Renaissance Italy: Words on Trial.* Trans. Frank Gordon.**

Leiden: Brill, 2016. Pp. xi, 274. ISBN 978-90-04-32545-6 (hardcover) US\$174.

Giorgio Caravale, a prolific scholar of early modern Italy, has published an excellent study of the Inquisition's attempts to curb subversive preachers. *Preaching and Inquisition* is a modified, English translation of his *Predicazione e Inquisizione nell'Italia del Cinquecento. Ippolito Chizzola tra eresia e controversia antiprottestante* (Bologna: Il Mulino, 2012). As the latter's subtitle indicates, the prime focus is on a leading preacher, Ippolito Chizzola from Brescia (1521–65), a Lateran Regular Canon, whose sermons in the 1540s came under attack and were investigated by the Roman Inquisition. Later, however, Chizzola became a “hero of the Counter Reformation” (4), when arguing against Pier Paolo Vergerio in a 1562 *Risposta* to some of his writings. This translation covers the prologue and the thirteen chapters of the original with minor additions. This is preceded by a helpful thirty-page “Introduction to the English Edition.”

The introduction outlines issues about the Catholic Church's handling of controversial preachers in the sixteenth century: namely, the problems of putting “Words on Trial.” It provides a useful guide to the recent historiography on the Roman Inquisition, and its handling of accused preachers. Caravale deals with the history of preaching in Renaissance Italy, seeing preaching and heresy as a two-sided coin to be studied, looking at continuity as well as disruption in pre-Reformation preaching. Caravale importantly warns historians about the dangers of uncritical adoption of the Inquisition perspective. He makes valuable points about the issues of orality in sermons and links with written culture, and about the limitations of sources for the inquisitors, given the meagre survival of notes, both for and about them, and the dubious reliability of what was recorded and reported. In the present case, “the transition from orality to

writing officially set forth Chizzola's switch from heterodoxy (whether real or presumed) to religious orthodoxy" (25). As Bernardino Ochino had noted in 1542, preachers could be "preaching Christ in a mask using jargon" (26). Italian preachers could apply the art of dissimulation to the printed words, and "write between the lines" (26). Chizzola was a dissimulator and Nicodemist, and used the latter technique. The prologue illustrates the parts played by Italian preachers in spreading heresy, and inquisitors' and popes' attempts to control sermonizing.

Chizzola emerged from Brescia, "Land of Contagion" (chapter 1), developed many dangerous friendships, and was part of a network of "Compromising Relationships" (chapters 2 and 3), including, very influentially, Massimiliano Celso Martinengo, Marcantonio Flaminio, Cardinals Morone and Pole, and their associates. He admitted a strong interest in the reform ideas of Juan de Valdés, who had fled from the Spanish Inquisition, and spread them in southern Italy. Chizzola was not an isolated preacher, and was well read in controversial literature. His numerous sermons, especially in Lenten cycles given in northern Italian cities, drew much attention and adverse comment. This led in 1548 to investigation and censure by the general chapter of his order, after involvement by the inquisitor of Cremona and the governor of Milan, Ferrante Gonzaga (chapter 4). His public apology from the Cremona pulpit was deemed inadequate, and rumours of continuing dubious preaching led to a Roman Inquisition investigation in 1549. Much information and gossip about his sermons were collected in the Brescia region and other parts of the Veneto. An appendix (182–247), transcribed from limited surviving evidence, summarized questions in Latin and Chizzola's Italian answers, with translations on opposite pages, from four Depositions in July and August 1549. Held in the offices of prosecutor (Fiscal) Nicolò Farfani, all four interrogations were in the presence of the leading theologian Teofilo Scullica, an Inquisition general commissioner. For the second long session, Egidio Foscari was there as seemingly the main questioner; interestingly, he was holding the office of Master of the Sacred Palace, then an office with major responsibility for censorship. For the last sessions, an unknown Signor Bernardino of Urbino sat with Scullica. This appendix is to be recommended for teaching purposes as exemplifying some skilful questioning by theologians of different views and backgrounds, the accused's ability to minimize trouble by evasive replies, pointing to views that were not yet condemned when he preached, and the useful loss of

memory, with “the mask of misunderstanding” (102). (Note: many footnote cross-references to the appendix are wrong, usually by ten pages, so follow the folio references instead.) The questioning largely focused on Chizzola’s views on justification and the certainty of salvation, the Eucharist, the role of saints, the denial of papal authority, and most notably the sacrament of confession. He was clearly an Erasmian preacher (chapter 5). In chapter 7, Caravale discusses the ambiguity of the Word, and the “the profile of a watchful dissimulator,” emerging from the testimonies (104). Following a verdict (text not known) in December 1551, Chizzola willingly agreed to abjure publicly, in Venice, where major complaints had been raised. Fairly rapidly, bans on his preaching were relaxed and, starting in Venice, he turned into a notable preacher of Catholic orthodoxy (to the disgust or derision of former associates), with reconsideration of the doctrine of two “justifications.”

The last chapters deal with Chizzola’s subsequent activities in Rome. From March 1560 to July 1562, he was Cosimo De Medici’s Roman spy (chapter 11). Correspondence between them shows Chizzola involved in fraught plans by the papacy to control the impending imperial succession and manipulate the electoral college. They indicate plans for him to attend the Council of Trent whenever recalled. Further service to the church came with his commission to collect a library of controversial literature to be used at the council, and then to polemicize against Pier Paolo Vergerio, taking vengeance on him for insults and insinuations, while also responding to the “scorpion’s tail” that Vergerio tried to pin on Giovanni Morone’s name (175). (This was after Chizzola and Morone had had their own antagonisms!)

In the Italian edition, a second appendix reproduced many letters between Chizzola and Cosimo. Caravale’s text translates good sections from them, but it is a pity that a selection of full, unpublished letters from 1556 to 1565 could not have been included in a shortened appendix in this excellent English version.

CHRISTOPHER F. BLACK

University of Glasgow