

Labour

Journal of Canadian Labour Studies

Le Travail

Revue d'Études Ouvrières Canadiennes



Ted McCoy, *Four Unruly Women: Stories of Incarceration and Resistance from Canada's Most Notorious Prison* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press 2019)

Nathalie Rech

Volume 86, automne 2020

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1074485ar>

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.1353/lt.2020.0049>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

Éditeur(s)

Canadian Committee on Labour History

ISSN

0700-3862 (imprimé)

1911-4842 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

Citer ce compte rendu

Rech, N. (2020). Compte rendu de [Ted McCoy, *Four Unruly Women: Stories of Incarceration and Resistance from Canada's Most Notorious Prison* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press 2019)]. *Labour / Le Travail*, 86, 198–200. <https://doi.org/10.1353/lt.2020.0049>

"Faro, Northwest Territories." (4) Faro is in Yukon. Such errors are numerous.

Thumbing a Ride ends with a series of horror stories, seemingly one after another after another, of mostly young women hitchhikers being sexually assaulted and often murdered. Problematically, Mahood presents a discourse on the subject reflected in the media without addressing whether such incidents were actually increasing in number, or merely being sensationalized. The result was a massive propaganda assault on hitchhiking. She concludes in asserting that the popularity of hitchhiking in Canada ended in the late 1970s "due to pressure on provincial and federal police to enforce restrictions on hitchhiking on highways and due to new municipal by-laws that banned hitchhiking in towns and cities." (248) However, her conclusions seem somewhat unsupported given her focus on sexual violence rather than political lobbying and legislation. Based on Mahood's own argument, the demise of hitchhiking likely resulted from a campaign of terror conducted in the media. Possibly Reid is closer to the truth in that by the 1980s the element of social trust was simply in short supply.

CHRISTOPHER POWELL
Edmonton, AB

Ted McCoy, *Four Unruly Women: Stories of Incarceration and Resistance from Canada's Most Notorious Prison* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press 2019)

TED MCCOY'S *Four Unruly Women* sheds light on some of the darkest moments of Kingston Penitentiary through the stories of four women incarcerated during the 19th and 20th centuries. Adopting a critical legal studies approach and a feminist framework, he invites us to look at the prison in a broader social

context in order to understand how patriarchy shaped both Canadian law and penology in response to crime, gender, and marginality.

McCoy draws a gloomy picture of the everyday life at the penitentiary for the inmate population over the period from 1835 to 1935, using penitentiary records as his main source. The originality of his work stems from disciplinary reports produced by the administration on inmate infractions and the punishments inflicted to unruly prisoners, a source that contrasts with the dryness of usual penitentiary records and offers insight into human relationships inside. Bridget Donnelly, Charlotte Reveille, Kate Slattery, and Emily Boyle (pseudonym) are the four women McCoy chose to support his story. As the author warns us, these might be exceptional cases, but they illustrate what every woman incarcerated at Kingston could potentially face during their incarceration: corporal punishment, physical restraint, solitary confinement, a bread and water diet, and sexual violence.

McCoy's biographical approach to these four lives also informs us about the development of the Canadian penitentiary system in relation to the development of industrial capitalism, and the elitist anxiety towards the working-class. McCoy's book shows the extent to which patriarchy and paternalism were central to Canadian society and to the microcosm of the prison. McCoy's effort to draw the portrait of the central figure of the matron is another of his original contributions to the understanding of women's carceral environments. He shows unambiguously that far from embodying the maternal and caring ideal presented by reformers and penologists alike, she rarely protected women from prison abuses, including sexual abuses from male staff or other forms of torture. The matron was the women prisoners'

favourite target for insults and a plethora of other ruses, not only because she worked the closest with them but also because she was resented for her authority, being the one, more often than not, who denounced their misbehaviours and called for punishment.

McCoy's most interesting contribution is undoubtedly the four biographies he presents in four successive chapters. At the centre of his storytelling lies their resistance and the acknowledgement they are, as Jackie Wang wrote, "subjects worthy of having a story of their own." Bridget Donnelly's entire adult life in and out prison exemplifies how poverty and incarceration were deeply intertwined, especially for immigrants to Canada during the 19th century. Her repeated stays at Kingston (and in local jails) for a variety of petty crimes mirror her continuing efforts to survive in times of dire needs.

With Charlotte Reville's story, McCoy explores issues of physical and mental health in confinement and how the carceral institution contributed to making individuals more vulnerable. In this chapter, McCoy exposes the complex figure of the prison surgeon and gives a glimpse on the medical experimentations to which prisoners were subject. McCoy highlights 19th-century debates in the medical field, especially when it came to "insanity" and shows how unscrupulous scientists used the penitentiary as a playing field in their dealings with individuals remote from public view and compassion.

Kate Slattery, an Irish immigrant like Donnelly and the third "incorrigible" character presented in the book, is another example of a petty criminal. Her repetitive disruptive behaviours at Kingston—shouting, insulting, and attacking other prisoners—were met with inhumane treatment, justified by the labels that prison officials imposed on her. Incarcerated at the end of the 19th century when recidivism became

associated with a "criminological type" and coupled with the penitentiary abandoning the possibility of reformation, she was deemed incorrigible. Moreover, when her confinement ended, she was deported to Ireland at the expense of the Canadian Department of Justice, as she was deemed unfit in terms of Canada's ideals of respectability and womanhood. Her story illustrates Canadian history of immigration laws and practices and finds an echo in today's detention centres and deportations.

The last chapter is dedicated to a woman incarcerated in the 1930s pseudonamed Emily Boyle and introduces another difficult subject: prison babies. Arriving twice at Kingston while pregnant, Boyle confronted prison officials' complex views on motherhood. Her second baby became the central issue in her dealings with the penitentiary officials; they suspected her of using her pregnancy to secure a parole and evade justice. Separated from her baby after the birth, she (and her husband) deployed repeated efforts to reunite while in custody. Boyle's vision of maternal love and motherhood clashed not only with the maternalist approach of the prison, but also with the state's interest in securing prisoners' labour. Her case is also relevant today, because of the high proportion of mothers incarcerated in Canada and elsewhere and the challenges they face.

McCoy's work demonstrates how the patriarchal authority represented by the warden and other prison officials was imposed through violence to correct women's misbehaviours. The power imbalance inherent to prison settings makes abuse and suffering inevitable concludes McCoy, even if he does not go as far as Gwénola Ricordeau in her recent essay *Pour elles toutes : femmes contre la prison* in advocating prison abolition. McCoy addresses the issue of class and women's incarceration but falls short

when it comes to race and the disproportion of women of colour in Canadian prisons. Furthermore, it would have been interesting to write the biography of an Indigenous woman to address the ongoing situation of Indigenous women's high incarceration rate in Canadian federal and provincial prisons. Seeing the development of the penitentiary as an instrument not only of industrial capitalism but also of settler colonialism would have allowed McCoy to grasp the "true nature of the beast" and even provide a better light on cases of immigrant women such as the ones he presents. Unruly women are and have been unfit to the settler project throughout the Americas, and many stories remain to be written on their resistance, including in carceral settings.

NATHALIE RECH

Université du Québec à Montréal

Sarah Glassford and Amy Shaw, eds.,
Making the Best of It: Women and Girls of Canada and Newfoundland During the Second World War (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press 2020)

THIS COLLECTION of twelve original essays reprises Glassford and Shaw's earlier collection, *A Sisterhood of Sorrowing and Service: Women and Girls of Canada and Newfoundland During the First World War* (Vancouver: UBC Press 2012). Framed by a strong introduction and conclusion as well as four section introductions, the editors provide contextual information tying the wars together and a critical approach to the much-debated older fascination with the degree to which war liberated women. While gender is central to the experiences of women and girls, it is not the only or defining identity since various communities structured these experiences, as well

as the opportunities that arose and the narratives created. Scholars need to ask 'which women' thus bringing into play age, class, religion, ethnicity, race and language among other factors.

Four essays on women, children and war comprise the first section. Childhood memories of the war are explored through the history of emotions by Barbara Lorenzkowski. Drawing on oral histories of sixteen women who grew up in Halifax and Saint John, she analyses children's "place-based emotional practices and experiences," (36) mindful of the effect of memory on her interviewees. Within families, neighborhoods and cities girls learned about war partly through emotions. Friendships formed and some lasted a lifetime. Young women met servicemen who often became part of the family as well as dance partners in chaperoned social settings, thus complicating the notion of servicemen's predatory behavior. Friendship was also key for British children evacuated to Canada, the subject of Claire Halstead's chapter which eschews oral history, preferring evidence from letters and memoirs written during the war. Canadian girls and women contributed to the war effort by welcoming "war guests" into their homes either through a private scheme or through the British government's Children's Overseas Reception Board. Parents used the terminology of friendship referring to Canada as a sister country bound by Commonwealth ties.

Lisa Moore's chapter examining three elite private schools for young women in Montreal fills a gap in our knowledge about adolescent experiences of the war in that province. There are few surprises here: English-speaking Protestant girls embraced the war effort while Francophone girls in a teacher training school and attending a mixed (French and English language) boarding school