
Renaissance and Reformation
Renaissance et Réforme



Debbagi Baranova, Tatiana. À coups de libelles. Une culture politique au temps des guerres de religion (1562–1598)

Annick MacAskill

Volume 37, Number 1, Winter 2014

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1090804ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.33137/rr.v37i1.21288>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Iter Press

ISSN

0034-429X (print)

2293-7374 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

MacAskill, A. (2014). Review of [Debbagi Baranova, Tatiana. À coups de libelles. Une culture politique au temps des guerres de religion (1562–1598)]. *Renaissance and Reformation / Renaissance et Réforme*, 37(1), 145–148. <https://doi.org/10.33137/rr.v37i1.21288>

Crawshaw shows that some survivors were put to work within the city, where they contributed to public health by treating the sick and disinfecting goods; such initiatives were also meant to give employment to those whose lives had been disrupted by their stay on the island hospitals. In sum, Crawshaw shows that early modern Venetian public health policies that clustered the plague sick onto the lazaretti islands were not draconian attempts at socially repressing the sick poor but rather state policies aimed to balance contemporary medical and religious ideas about care and cure—with the imperatives of protecting the city and its all-important trade economy.

A stimulating case study of two hospitals in their specific medical, social, political, and economic contexts, this book should be read by all historians of medicine and epidemic disease in early modern Europe. It also significantly contributes to the historiography of early modern Venice by showing how economic, spiritual, and civic concerns shaped public health initiatives and state building. *Plague Hospitals* should serve as a model for how to research and write about complex and multifaceted institutions in relation to the specific social and political contexts in which they operated. The volume is handsomely constructed and enriched with high quality images of contemporary maps, architectural plans, photographs of objects, and archeological sites. This however means that *Plague Hospitals* is expensive; its \$124.95 price tag will likely put it out of reach for most scholars.

JOHN CHRISTOPOULOS
York University

Debbagi Baranova, Tatiana.

À coups de libelles. Une culture politique au temps des guerres de religion (1562–1598). Préface de Denis Crouzet.

Cahiers d'Humanisme et Renaissance 104. Geneva: Droz, 2012. Pp. 502. ISBN 978-2-600-01577-6 (paperback) \$69.60.

À coup de libelles is the revised version of a doctoral thesis supervised by Denis Crouzet, who provides the book's preface. Those familiar with Crouzet's work on the culture of religious conflict in sixteenth-century France will recognize his influence in Tatiana Debbagi Baranova's contribution. Like Crouzet, she

presents a historical analysis on an aspect of the realities of social violence in the Religious Wars: in this case, the written attacks emerging from all sides of the conflict over no less than three and a half decades. Besides the texts themselves, she lends her attention to the nebulous notion of an “opinion,” drawing on work not only by other historians but also by political scientists, sociologists, and philosophers. Such an approach can be tricky, and may seem to go against the precision expected of a history book, but the author’s erudition and attention to detail allow her to put forth hypotheses on the general atmosphere of France’s civil wars without hyperbole or vagueness.

The *Zeitgeist* in question reveals itself in the variety of *libelles* examined. In the book’s introduction, Debaggi Baranova explains that sixteenth-century French *libelles* correspond more or less to what we know of as pamphlet literature or propaganda, the words “pamphlet” and “propagande” not yet having been introduced in France. Using a historiographical approach informed by the methods of Paris’ École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales, Debaggi Baranova proceeds by case studies (*études de cas*), reading a wide selection of polemical literature from France’s Religious Wars, from both printed and manuscript sources.

The author contextualizes the opinions of the Religious Wars by first examining publications from the previous decades. In particular, the impassioned texts surrounding *les Guerres d’Italie* reveal a pre-existing model for public debate on controversial subjects. Debaggi Baranova does not organize chapters according to chronology, but rather arranges them by theme and methodology: “Le libelle entre la condamnation et la nécessité” (41–146), “La rhétorique et la communication politique” (147–242), “Ennemi, argumentation et situation rhétorique” (243–336), “La publication: procédés et ambitions” (337–98), and “Autour d’une fiction: juger en privé des affaires publiques” (399–464). Yet within each chapter, the case studies from 1562 to 1598 are situated with historical precedents.

Reading an impressive variety of texts—which includes poetry, political tracts, satirical texts from inside the *Parlement de Paris*, and histories—Debaggi Baranova takes a rhetorical approach that allows her to tease out the *loci communes* that appear and reappear, *mutatis mutandum*, over several decades. Informed by the works of specialists of early modern French literature, like Marc Fumaroli, Francis Goyet, and Jean Lecointe, she shows how the authors

of polemical texts choose to adapt their message to their situation and to their readers, often encouraging mature reflection, despite first appearances.

In addition to this kind of literary reading, she assiduously exposes the details of the texts' production and publication, thus contributing at the same time to the emerging field of book history. That being said, one important aspect of book history, the roles of individual printers and editors, is not accorded much attention: even major players like the Estienne family, associated with moderate and reformed authors (see the works of H el ene Cazes), or Nicolas Chesneau, a printer known for publishing extreme Catholic tracts (see the works of Luc Racaut), are not considered. To give a comprehensive reading of the literary culture of the French civil wars, it would be necessary to consider some of the major figures of this profession, especially given that the emergence of the printing press is one reason for the increasing proliferation of libellous literature, as Debaggi Baranova herself notes (466).

As might be expected, and as recently suggested by such other historians as Larissa Taylor, specialist of the Parisian *pr edicateur* Fran ois Le Picart, a close examination of some sixteenth-century texts reveals the strong presence of a middle ground, represented by authors who show more concern for peace or *le bien commun* than for *ad hominem* attacks or strict adherence to dogma, be it Catholic or Reformed. Michel de l'Hospital, for example, following in the tradition of European preachers, provides an alternative model of criticism where "impersonal" satire—that is, satire that does not target any one person—takes on a moral dimension when it promotes reconciliation. Satire is thus an *otium* (60) worthy of a man charged with protecting the good of the nation. This conclusion echoes that of another recent study of French culture during the Religious Wars, Aldo Genna 's *L'id el du repos dans la litt erature fran aise du seizi me si cle* (Paris: Classiques Garnier, 2011). Though Genna  focuses exclusively on "high" literature, like Debaggi Baranova he sees satire as a very personal, isolated pursuit (which he also designates as a form of *otium*), which can nonetheless work for the betterment of the common good (a kind of universal *repos*).

According to Debaggi Baranova's analysis, the three and a half decades of the Religious Wars give place to a strong penchant for libellous literature. King Henri IV's reign in general and his 1598  dit de Nantes in particular mark the beginning of a more tolerant era, though defamatory works do not, of course, disappear from France altogether in the seventeenth century. Indeed, the *libelle*

constitutes an essential component of early modern French culture, not just that of the sixteenth century, and the texts of the Religious Wars will serve as models for future publications, especially in their use of rhetoric. Debaggi Baranova's case for the importance of this emerging genre certainly seems well founded, strengthened by the multiple disciplines that enrich her reading of individual cases.

In addition to the body of the work, the book includes an impressive, though apparently only partial (*sélective*), bibliography (470–505), as well as an index (507–14) and table of contents (517–20). Unfortunately, the index only offers the names of the authors and political figures covered in the book, where a list of predominant themes, places of publication, and titles (given that many of the texts studied are anonymous) would also have been helpful.

ANNICK MACASKILL

University of Western Ontario

de Courcelles, Dominique (éd.).

Parcourir le monde, les voyages d'Orient.

Études et rencontres de l'École des Chartes. Paris: École des Chartes, 2013. 234 p. ISBN 978-2-35723-032-3 (broché) 34 €.

Dominique de Courcelles a réuni, dans cette publication, dix articles issus d'un colloque tenu à l'École des Chartes en mars 2012 en l'honneur du Professeur Khaled Al-Ankary. La publication, qui s'inscrit dans la perspective du dialogue des cultures, nous conduit par des chemins divers vers un Orient vu par la lorgnette de cartographes, voyageurs, savants et écrivains. La fourchette chronologique est large, allant du Moyen Âge au XX^e siècle. Si une majorité d'articles portent sur la péninsule arabe, l'on n'hésite pas à parcourir des territoires connexes (Tripoli, Jérusalem, Égypte, océan Indien).

La publication est divisée en six parties et est précédée d'un prologue de Dominique de Courcelles. Trois articles portent plus précisément sur des aspects liés à la cartographie. En ouverture de volume, Khaled Al-Ankary (p. 12–26) offre une classification commentée des cartes de l'Arabie réalisées depuis l'Antiquité, identifiant les sources et les étapes qui ont permis leur élaboration. Quatorze cartes en couleur illustrant les propos du chercheur se