MUSICultures
The Journal of the Canadian Society for Traditional Music
La revue de la Société canadienne pour les traditions musicales

Hagmann, Lea. 2021. Celtic Music and Dance in Cornwall: Cornu-Copia

Heather Sparling

Volume 50, 2023

URI: https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1110024ar
DOI: https://doi.org/10.7202/1110024ar

See table of contents

Publisher(s)

Canadian Society for Traditional Music / La Société canadienne pour les traditions musicales

ISSN

1920-4213 (print)
1920-4221 (digital)

Explore this journal

Cite this review

Sparling, H. (2023). Review of [Hagmann, Lea. 2021. Celtic Music and Dance in Cornwall: Cornu-Copia]. *MUSICultures*, *50*, 304–308. https://doi.org/10.7202/1110024ar

Hagmann, Lea. 2021. ***Celtic Music and Dance in Cornwall: Cornu-Copia.*** New York: Routledge. 238 pp.

HEATHER SPARLING
Cape Breton University

This book will be key for anyone interested in understanding Cornish traditional music and dance and their revivals. There is simply no other book-length scholarly study that so thoroughly reviews the historical sources to chronicle a history of Cornish music and dance as well as their current practice. As the author shows, there has been very little research to date on these topics.

Celtic Music and Dance in Cornwall documents the history of the Cornish music and dance revival of the late twentieth and early twenty-first centuries. A nationalist cultural revival began in the 1970s that looked to Cornwall's Celtic heritage to define its distinctiveness from England. Ethnomusicologist and linguist Lea Hagmann's aims are to understand Celto-Cornish music and dance within the context of the revival, the means by which revivalists have defined them, and the evolution of Cornish music, dance, and their revival over time. The book is generally organized chronologically. In the first four chapters, Hagmann offers a brief history of Cornwall and the Cornish language (Kernewek), examines historical sources with evidence of (distinctive) music and dance in Cornwall, and traces various influential revivals, including the Cornish language revival, the first and second British folk revivals, and Celtic music revivals. In the following four chapters, Hagmann documents the history of the Cornish music and dance revival.

Hagmann draws heavily from Livingston's (1999) influential work on music revivals, as well as Hill and Bithell's developments (2014) of Livingston's theory. Hagmann makes a convincing case that the traditional Cornish music and dance scene is a revival sharing many common features with other music revivals, including its emergence as an expression of dissatisfaction with the prevailing political, economic, and social circumstances in Cornwall; its greater concern with the present and future despite its apparent focus on the past; the significance of "core revivalists" in defining and moving the revival forward; the development of a revival community; the tendency to treat revived tunes and dances as unchangeable; evidence of musical and dance creativity despite claims of accurate transmission of authentic sources; and the centrality of a revival ideology (in the case of Cornwall, collected materials must be demonstrably "Celtic" and not "Anglo-Saxon" while being distinctly Cornish). Indeed, Hagmann points out that the Cornish revival is consistent with Livingston's definition of "ethnic revivals," those influenced by the desire of a marginalized group to distinguish itself from a hegemonic group (here, a desire to distinguish Cornish culture from English culture by linking it to other Celtic cultures).

Hagmann does a truly magnificent job of identifying and drawing on a very thorough range of both historical and contemporary sources. She starts with the oldest-known written references to instruments and dancing in Cornwall in the medieval *Vocabularium Cornicum*, a Latin-Cornish dictionary written in Old Cornish. A number of middle Cornish dramas and miracle plays make explicit ref-

erence to instruments and musical events. She considers fifteenth- and sixteenth-century stone and woodcarvings of musicians and dancers. The depictions of pipers were especially important for more recent efforts to ascertain whether Cornish pipes were different from bagpipes elsewhere in the Celtic world. She considers Late Cornish song texts and draws on her linguistic training to analyze musical vocabulary and the song lyrics, leading her to question just how distinctively Cornish any instruments or song texts actually were. She suggests that they are perhaps more likely to have originated outside of Cornwall. Much of the music and dance practised in Cornwall historically was part of a broad common practice. In other words, it's hard to make the case for uniquely Cornish instruments and song texts.

Hagmann considers depictions of music and dance in a range of materials, including church records, town records, private records, and the accounts of religious personnel concerned with the dangers of secular music and dance. She discusses historical descriptions of Morris dancing, guise-dancing, carol-singing, wassailing, Cornish May Day festivities (Padstow Mayday and Helston Flora Day), Furry dances, church music, brass bands, and country dancing in Cornwall. None have Celtic cultural roots despite significant revivalist efforts to give Cornish music and dance a Celtic pedigree. She reviews key song collections, including Sabine Baring-Gould's *Songs and Ballads of the West* (first published in 1889), Ralph Dunstan's early twentieth-century song books (which were criticized for comprising mostly Cornish translations of English folksongs and new compositions), and materials published in *Old Cornwall: The Journal of the Federation of Old Cornwall Societies* and edited by Robert Morton Nance (who didn't cite his sources and who made significant changes to materials published, making it difficult for revivalists to differentiate between collected and created materials).

A lack of information and details about Cornish dances led revivalists to interview elderly informants about their recollections of dances, although informants' memories were often limited and imperfect, leading revivalists to reinvent and reconstruct dances based on assumptions and models elsewhere in the Celtic world. Hagmann critically analyzes the musical features of tunes and songs in order to assess the ways and extent to which they may have been "Celtified." In other cases, she dissects tunes to assess the extent to which new compositions have either been miscopied or created on paper (rather than orally) by amateur musicians, resulting in melodic oddities. In yet other situations, she reviews the contents of tunebooks in order to assess the degree to which particular stylistic traits are evident, such as the predominance of particular time signatures, modes, and structures. She parses album imagery and repertoire to trace the evolution of the Cornish music and dance revival in terms of symbolism, repertoire, and style.

Hagmann identifies key players in the Cornish music and dance revival, such as Brenda Wootton, a folk singer who became well known especially in the 1970s and 1980s for singing Cornish language songs newly composed by Richard Gendall (although Wootton herself never became an accomplished Cornish speaker) and who recorded twenty albums, mostly focused on Celto-Cornish themes. Where

Wootton influenced the song community, the Davey brothers and their band, Bucca (1977-82) — and later as members of a number of other bands — were particularly influential on the instrumental tradition. Merv Davey researched Cornish music and dance extensively, ultimately writing a PhD dissertation on the topic and becoming involved in efforts to reconstruct a set of Cornish bagpipes. He was also a founding member of the first Cornish dance team, Cam Kernewek, followed closely by the establishment of Ros Keltek, involving his brother, Andy Davey, as a founding member. Various Davey family members collected and published edited collections of dances, songs, and tunes which became foundational texts in the Cornish music and dance revival, treated as historically authentic by the revival community despite the fact that they were often based on quite partial and sometimes unreliable source materials.

I would contend that Hagmann's most insightful contribution is the case she makes for the eventual division of the Cornish music and dance revival into two paths, each with a different ideology, style of music and dance, repertoire, performance context, and active agents. Hagmann labels these two factions the *Troyl* revival and the *Nos Lowen* revival. The Troyl revivalists were those who are deeply invested in identifying "authentic" Cornish music and dance (so long as it had a putative Celtic pedigree) in historical sources. Troylists have focused on research and reviving music and dance from the past. Unfortunately for the Troylists, many early music and especially dance sources documented practices that were part of a broader (i.e., English) folk tradition and were not distinctively Cornish. Consequently, for political/nationalist reasons, many tunes and dances were modified by the Troylists in deliberate acts of "Celticification," as Hagmann meticulously documents. Troylists looked to Ireland and Scotland as models so that Celtification involves, for example, the use of stereotypical Celtic symbols, choosing or modifying tunes with mostly minor and modal keys, the use of the Celto-Cornish language, and the use of stereotypical Celtic instruments.

The Nos Lowen revival emerged around the turn of the millennium, combining the Celtic heritage propounded by the Troylists with contemporary youth culture, resulting in a new Cornish musical style and new Cornish dances. There are political reasons for this movement too, particularly as a response to the large number of wealthy Londoners who regularly retire to Cornwall without any particular knowledge of the region or commitment to its culture, and because Cornwall is one of the UK's poorest regions. Nos Lowenists believed that young people needed to be empowered, which they felt could be accomplished if they felt pride in something they could consider to be "theirs." Whereas the Troylists looked to Ireland and Scotland — and to the past — for inspiration, Nos Lowenists looked to Brittany (in France) and the present for inspiration.

In an effort to engage more young people in traditional Cornish music and dance, and to emphasize the social aspect of dancing, Nos Lowenists encouraged simple chain dances that don't require instruction or a caller. Dance music became more improvisatory and instrumental music began to incorporate global sounds, styles, and instruments. Newcom-

ers were encouraged to modify dances or create new ones. A 5/4 time signature became emblematic of Nos Lowen music. Whereas Hagmann suggests that Troylists were involved in "Celtification," she suggests that Nos Lowenists were engaged in "Celticity," a Celtic identity defined by Dietler as one grounded in spiritual connections decoupled from essentializing notions of race, genealogy, and even language. Not surprisingly, some Troylists were troubled by the "inauthenticity" and inventions of the Nos Lowen movement, as well as the Nos Lowenists' greater commercial and professional orientation.

The one aspect of this book that I wish were better developed is the author's presence. Lea Hagmann is an ethnomusicologist who lived in Cornwall for a time, who returned there on numerous occasions, participated in the Cornish musical scene as a musician, interviewed people, and built relationships. But Hagmann's ethnographic experiences, when acknowledged at all, are typically mentioned only briefly and in passing. This book comes across as very well researched, well argued, and logically structured, but it lacks the warmth and engagement of personal anecdotes and ethnographic descriptions. This book is essential reading because it does such a magnificent job of documenting the history of the Cornish music and dance revival, including naming the individuals and artists involved, the publications they produced, the tunes and dances they documented or created, and the albums they recorded. But it can be hard to remember them all or keep them straight when so many of them come across as data rather than as human actors, relationships, and experiences.

On a smaller but related matter, I found myself distracted by the frequency with which "[sic]" appears when Hagmann quotes sources, particularly contemporary sources by people who are currently active in the Cornish music and dance scene. While there's nothing wrong with using [sic] to assure the reader that a spelling mistake or atypical grammar occurred in the original and is not a mistake on Hagmann's part, the frequency of its appearance implies that her sources are perhaps less educated, articulate, or careful. Personally, I would be more inclined simply to make editorial corrections using square brackets to preserve the flow of the text and to minimize consultant errors while remaining true to the original. Better yet, I'd ask consultants to read the text and invite them to correct any technical errors so that square brackets need not be used at all. I'm also disappointed that there doesn't seem to be a companion website or even YouTube playlists to provide readers with easy access to music and dances discussed.

In short, Hagmann's book is essential reading for anyone interested not just in Cornish expressive culture but in Celtic music and dance or in music and dance revivals more broadly. Given the amount of research that has been produced about Scottish and Irish music and dance traditions, the lack of scholarly material about Cornish music and dance is rather shocking, not to mention frustrating. Hagmann's meticulous and detailed review of sources of information — both historical and contemporary — provides an invaluable literature review, identifying entry points for those wanting to further research Cornish music and dance, while her categorization of more recent trajecto-

ries of Cornish music and dance into the Troyl and Nos Lowen movements helps to make sense of what might otherwise appear to be contradictory activities.

REFERENCES

Hill, Juniper, and Caroline Bithell. 2014. An Introduction to Music Revival as Concept, Cultural Process, and Medium of Change. In *The Oxford Handbook of Music Revival*, 3–42. Ed. C. Bithell and J. Hill. New York: Oxford University Press.

Livingston, Tamara E. 1999. Music Revivals: Towards a General Theory. *Ethnomusicology* 43 (1): 66–85.

Amico, Marta. 2022. ***La Fabrique d'une musique touarègue. Un son du désert dans la World Music.*** Paris : Karthala. 322 pp.

ZINEB MAJDOULI
Université catholique de Lille

Marta Amico nous propose dans cet ouvrage, issu de sa thèse de doctorat soutenue en 2013 à l'EHESS, une anthropologie multi-située du fait musical. En observant les itinéraires de plusieurs troupes de musiques touarègues dans les circuits marchands internationaux labellisés « Musiques du monde », elle cartographie la multiplicité des acteurs, des actions et des discours qui procèdent à la caractérisation de cette musique comme telle. Comme elle l'annonce si bien dans son introduction, les énoncés « musique du désert », « musique touarègue » ou « blues du désert » ne vont pas de soi. En s'appuyant sur la notion de « branchement » de Jean-Loup Amselle (2001) et sur celle des « mondes de l'art » d'Howard Becker (1988), elle étudie donc la « fabrique » de cette musique, imbriquée dans les enjeux sociopolitiques et marchands qui la constituent.

Dans le premier chapitre, intitulé « Du Désert à la scène », l'auteure nous livre d'abord une généalogie de l'apparition de la catégorie « musique touarègue » puis expose sa démarche, ses choix méthodologiques pour se saisir de cet objet musical mondialisé. Son terrain suit les itinéraires de deux groupes, Tartit et Tinariwen. Ensuite, c'est l'observation des festivals maliens qui lui permet de procéder à une comparaison des représentations de cette musique « ici » (en France principalement) et « là-bas » (au Mali). Elle avertit tout de suite le lecteur : loin de chercher l'essence d'une musique dans son territoire, elle montre plutôt que les paradigmes (tradition, « touareguité ») sur lesquels s'appuient ces catégories se négocient et sont retraduits en situation. Elle mène évidemment des entretiens avec les musiciens, les tourneurs, les directeurs et programmateurs de festivals au Mali et en France. Elle observe les concerts, accompagne les musiciens dans leurs activités ordinaires en tournée, en répétition, se déplace dans les foires internationales et se met en lien avec les acteurs parisiens du label Musiques du monde. Elle rassemble et analyse leurs discours mais aussi les textes qui accompagnent le travail des musiciens sur les brochures, les affiches ou les magazines. Elle montre ainsi, chose passionnante, que la musique touarègue telle qu'elle est proposée en Europe n'existe pas dans le désert et qu'il s'agit d'un ensemble de pratiques et de traditions imbriquées dans les acti-