

Labour

Journal of Canadian Labour Studies

Le Travail

Revue d'Études Ouvrières Canadiennes



Catherine E. Connelly, *Enduring Work: Experiences with Canada's Temporary Foreign Worker Program* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2023)

Susan Cake

Volume 93, Spring 2024

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1112043ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.52975/lt.2024v93.024>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Canadian Committee on Labour History

ISSN

0700-3862 (print)

1911-4842 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Cake, S. (2024). Review of [Catherine E. Connelly, *Enduring Work: Experiences with Canada's Temporary Foreign Worker Program* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2023)]. *Labour / Le Travail*, 93, 361–363.

<https://doi.org/10.52975/lt.2024v93.024>

que nous aurions intérêt cependant à lire en parallèle avec celle de Silvia Federici sur le même sujet (voir l'introduction à *Le capitalisme patriarcal*, 2019). Federici, théoricienne du travail reproductif depuis 50 ans (Federici, 1975), y vulgarise de façon simple et limpide des concepts étudiés par Vogel. On y trouve là aussi une théorie « unitaire » de l'oppression des femmes, une théorie pionnière de la reproduction sociale. Il est heureux que nous ayons enfin accès en français à ces œuvres essentielles du corpus Marxiste féministe.

LOUISE TOUPIN

Université du Québec à Montréal

Catherine E. Connelly, *Enduring Work: Experiences with Canada's Temporary Foreign Worker Program* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2023)

THE CANADIAN Temporary Foreign Worker Program (TFWP) has long been a subject of critique, accused of facilitating the abuse of temporary foreign workers (TFWs) and potentially undercutting wages for Canadian workers. In her comprehensive analysis, *Enduring Work: Experiences with Canada's Temporary Foreign Worker Program*, Catherine E. Connelly delves into all streams of the Canadian Temporary Foreign Worker Program (TFWP), including the Seasonal Agricultural Worker Program (SAWP), the In-Home Caregiver, and the high-wage and low-wage streams. Drawing from 103 interviews—encompassing 55 workers (with 49 being TFWs), 36 employers, and an additional 12 individuals connected to the program—Connelly presents an empirically-grounded exploration of the challenges embedded in the TFWP.

Beginning with an overview, Connelly navigates through the details of the various TFWP streams, shedding light on

their unique characteristics. The subsequent chapters review the mistreatment and abuses faced by workers in different streams drawing from the experiences of TFW interviewed, underscoring the systemic flaws within the program, including the ramifications of closed work permits. A dedicated chapter probes the role of agents, individuals who facilitate applications under the program, adding an extra layer of complexity to the analysis. Connelly further broadens the scope by incorporating perspectives from comparable countries that offer similar programs, and reviews how workers come to choose Canada. Additionally, Connelly explores employers' viewpoints and considers both the challenges and advantages perceived by those participating in the TFWP, as well as the assumptions some employers make about workers. She develops a typology of employers as either reluctant or reckless users of the program. The final chapter reviews recommendations made by various lobbying groups for governmental interventions to improve the program while trying to balance the interests of workers and employers.

Connelly's work, while acknowledging the expected violations, succeeds in bringing to light the wider extent of the abuses within the TFWP. The approach of integrating results from all streams in each chapter allows for a holistic comparison of experiences, highlighting that despite improvements over the years, forms of abuse persist across all streams. This challenges the notion that the program's issues are isolated or that certain streams have addressed past concerns. It refutes the idea that worker mistreatment stems solely from a few bad actors and suggests that it is systemic.

The book provides a nuanced understanding of how workers in each stream experience different mistreatments. For example, the In-Home Caregiver

program, despite no longer requiring workers to live with their employers, reveals instances where employers still insist on it. Connelly found that living with an employer can lead to personalized forms of abuse, such as forcing workers to cut their hair or not acknowledging their birthday. In some dire cases, TFWs worked for family members, which increased the risk of reporting any abuse or mistreatment due to familial and professional social networks.

The breadth of the book extends to diverse sectors and industries, capturing a wide variety of experiences given the inclusion of all streams. Geographically, interviews span most provinces, and the involvement of TFWs from 18 different countries enriches the narrative with a global perspective. Beyond the workers, Connelly brings in the voices of employers and agents, adding layers of nuance. One notable view that appears to be missing is that of people involved in the program development and regulation. The inclusion of many perspectives allows for a more comprehensive understanding of the complexities of the program.

Another comprehensive aspect of the book is the comparative analysis with similar programs in other countries. This not only enriches the narrative but also challenges the assumption that TFWs are rescued from dire conditions in their home countries and Canada is their only choice. The book demonstrates that employers may be unaware of the alternatives these workers have, which, in some cases, they have used to justify worker mistreatment.

However, with commendable breadth, there are moments where the analysis lacks depth. Some results appear supported by only one interview or the view of one participant. While each perspective is valid, it becomes challenging to discern whether the experience is unique or indicative of broader trends.

Connelly also uses various theoretical perspectives to analyze different sections of the book, including agency theory, social capital, a person-organization or person-environment fit perspective, and a theoretical utility analysis focused on employer's human resource decisions. However, the somewhat disjointed application of multiple perspectives in each chapter leaves the impression that theories are being used for convenience rather than fully developing theoretical frameworks to inform data collection and analysis for the complete project.

The recurring term "enduring" acts as a connecting thread throughout the book, linking the endurance of TFW despite their mistreatment with the enduring existence of the entire TFWP despite persistent criticism. While a clever mnemonic device, the analogies between workers' experiences, enduring problems with agents, and the endurance of a government program are debatable. This raises the question of whether there was a missed opportunity to develop "enduring work" as a theoretical framework, exploring the challenges of endurance in various employment settings and geopolitical landscapes for workers as well as the enduring demands of a global capitalist system.

Enduring Work stands as a commendable contribution for both academic and general audiences. Despite certain theoretical shortcomings, its accessibility, and the timely comprehensive exploration of Canada's TFWP in the context of claimed worker shortages make it an important contribution. By adding nuance to the critique of the program, Connelly's book offers a valuable resource for understanding the intricate challenges embedded in Canada's temporary foreign worker program, across all streams and compared to global counterparts. The book invites readers to reflect on the broader implications of exploitative employment

practices, urging governments to consider lasting solutions in the evolving landscape of international labour mobility.

SUSAN CAKE

Athabasca University

Centre d'histoire des régulations sociales (CHRS), *Déjouer la fatalité : pauvreté, familles, institutions* (Cyberexposition, Montréal, 2022)

ADAPTÉE D'UNE exposition présentée à l'Écomusée du fier monde en 2019, la cyberexposition *Déjouer la fatalité : pauvreté, famille et institutions* est le résultat d'une collaboration entre les professeur·e·s et étudiant·e·s du Centre d'histoire des régulations sociales. Intéressée par l'histoire de la vulnérabilité, de la marginalité et de la criminalité, l'équipe pluridisciplinaire du CHRS propose une synthèse de la prise en charge des plus vulnérables par les institutions québécoises de régulation sociale aux 19^e et 20^e siècles. Cette cyberexposition, accessible en français et en anglais, s'adresse à un public général. L'intégration d'une bibliographie et de documents d'archives bonifie le contenu et permet aux internautes d'approfondir les sujets abordés dans l'exposition. En ciblant principalement les villes de Montréal et Québec pour la période allant de 1840 à 1930, l'équipe de recherche s'intéresse aux concepts de déviance, de criminalité, de vieillissement, de santé et de travail dans un contexte institutionnel.

L'exposition prend la révolution industrielle du début du 19^e siècle comme point de départ. Les conséquences socio-économiques de cette période sur les familles québécoises, particulièrement celles provenant du milieu ouvrier, s'observent dans l'étude de leur vécu et de leur expérience. Cette partie de l'exposition permet alors de mettre la table pour les transformations à venir, comme

la montée du mouvement ouvrier et le développement du réseau institutionnel du Québec. Concernant ce dernier point, il faut mentionner la carte du réseau d'institutions de régulation sociale de Montréal couvrant la période allant de 1841 à 1921. En plus de regrouper et de situer ces institutions de prise en charge, cet outil interactif permet d'observer leur évolution et même leur étalement urbain de la seconde moitié du 19^e siècle jusqu'au début du 20^e siècle.

Par la suite, le corps de l'exposition commence par un survol de la criminalité et de la délinquance juvénile observées au Québec aux 19^e et 20^e siècles. Il est d'abord question de la répression et surtout de la régulation des activités considérées comme « déviantes ». La marginalisation de ceux et celles s'adonnant au vagabondage ou à la prostitution crée une « petite criminalité » difficilement contrôlable, devant être réprimée et surtout régulée. La montée de la justice sommaire montre, par exemple, la volonté de l'État de réguler efficacement les groupes marginaux. Concernant la répression de la délinquance juvénile, le système de justice adopte une approche que l'on pourrait qualifier de « protectionnelle », c'est-à-dire que le niveau de vulnérabilité du jeune délinquant est au centre des jugements de la cour. Autrefois envoyés en prison, les jeunes sont maintenant placés dans des écoles de réforme ou d'industrie. Afin de traiter adéquatement la délinquance juvénile, le système de justice met en place un tribunal dédié aux enfants.

La prise en charge institutionnelle, à la naissance et au moment de la mort, est un thème qui englobe deux sections de la cyberexposition. Pour la naissance et la maternité, il faut mentionner la réclusion des femmes enceintes célibataires dans des hôpitaux de la Miséricorde jusqu'à leur accouchement