

Book Notes / Références Bibliographiques

Volume 15, 1985

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/llt15bn01>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Canadian Committee on Labour History

ISSN

0700-3862 (print)

1911-4842 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this document

(1985). Book Notes / Références Bibliographiques. *Labour/Le Travailleur*, 15, 273–278.

BOOK NOTES / RÉFÉRENCES BIBLIOGRAPHIQUES

Verner Smitheram, David Milne, and Satadal Dasgupta, *The Garden Transformed: Prince Edward Island, 1945-1980* (Charlottetown: Ragweed Press 1982).

COMMENT ON THE history of Prince Edward Island's working class has been rare indeed. There is something to be found in Sharpe's *People's History* and, predictably, Eugene Forsey's many writings are a source to mine for information. More recently, Ian McKay has accumulated some data on early twentieth-century strikes and placed them alongside the more visible and vibrant histories of conflict in the mainland Maritime provinces. This volume does little to go beyond such modest beginnings: none of the essays address working-class experience directly. J.M. Bumstead's article on the historiography of the province offers us some answers on why the admittedly modest working-class presence has been so easily bypassed, stressing the narrow way in which the island's history has been structured by treatment of the land question. Those with an interest in labour, however, will find food for thought in Andrew Robb's discussion of third parties and their fortunes in the post-Confederation years. In the swirl of farmer, progressive, labour, and social democratic politics, however limited, lies a part of workers' lives, and a part of the way in which the garden has been transformed.

Alice Cook, Val R. Lorwin, and Arlene Kaplan Daniels, eds., *Women and Trade*

Unions in Eleven Industrialized Countries (Philadelphia: Temple University Press 1984).

ONE PICKS UP this book with pleasure and wonderment. It is useful to have a quick run-through of the structural contours of women's experience within trade unions and economic life in a range of national settings. It sets the mind spinning, however, to explain the presence of separate chapters on Denmark, Finland, Norway, and Sweden, Great Britain and Ireland, and the absence of any commentary on Canada. Given Canada's proximity to the United States and the country's role as a magnet attracting immigrants from many of the countries examined in this collection, this is a major deficiency. Certainly the work that has been produced over the course of the last decade, appearing in such diverse forums as the *New Left Review* and publications of the National Council on the Status of Women, deserves inclusion in this edited volume. And as Cook, Lorwin, and Daniels should know, it reinforces an appreciation of the common themes running through the histories of women and work: economic restructuring and technological change; patriarchal relations and their impact within trade unions; the particular needs of women as they relate to health and safety as well as reproductive issues; and the persistence of wage inequities defined by gender. These are the substantive matters of this collection, as well as the proletarianization and unionization of women workers. They are at the centre of the experience of many Canadian women, just as they are the

centre of much new, and apparently unappreciated, Canadian literature.

Philip S. Foner, ed., *Black Socialist Preacher: The Teachings of Reverend George Washington Woodbey and his Disciple Reverend George W. Slater, Jr.* (San Francisco: Synthesis Publications 1983).

BORN A SLAVE, Woodbey was the Socialist Party of America's leading black spokesman in the first decade of the twentieth century. His reflections on the relationship of race and socialism echo the party's commitment to equal rights for blacks as well as its failure to address the special oppressions of black Americans and the particular conditions of black workers. Foner introduces Woodbey's writings and the speeches and articles of three other progressive/socialist Negro ministers with a commentary on Socialist Party ideology, the place of religion in the emergence of black socialism, and Woodbey's contributions to party debates, free speech fights, and organizational efforts. He links Woodbey's thought to nineteenth-century currents, including Bellamyite nationalism, but points to how the reverend moved beyond utopianism to socialism. All of those interested in American society should examine this collection of black writings, for the perspectives of Woodbey and his predecessors and disciples drive to the core of American experience in the populist and progressive ages. Even the titles will tell you this much: "Tillman vs. Till-Men;" "The New Emancipation;" "The Hell of War;" and "The Distribution of Wealth."

Mike Holbrook-Jones, *Supremacy and Subordination of Labour: The Hierarchy of Work in the Early Labour Movement* (London: Heinemann Educational Books 1982).

THIS IS A difficult book, awkwardly and

abstractly written. Its thesis requires considerable elaboration and further empirical substantiation. But the argument itself is fascinating and significant. Holbrook-Jones attempts to root the fragmentation of working-class life and the reformist character of trade union leadership and organization in the ways in which the labour process is structured by capital. But he also acknowledges that class is an active process and that workers have taken the structures of subordination and restructured them through their own active intervention. He sees all of this taking place in the second half of the nineteenth century and he substantiates his theoretical premises with studies of mining, engineering, and cotton spinning, the former being the most closely examined. Out of the raw material of a working experience internally divided and disciplined, Holbrook-Jones contends, emerged a modern labour movement that reproduced and perpetuated the sectoral boundaries of work organization in labour consciousness and trade union affiliation. This, rather than simple economism, kept the trade unions within the bounds of reformism. If the text is marred by stylistic lapses, schematic silliness, and a narrowness of focus, Holbrook-Jones has nevertheless pointed historians past the dilemmas of the labour aristocracy debate and into areas of substance. He has suggested the content of a new project, beyond Braverman, in which the exploration of ideology is seen as a two-way street, a struggle between contending social classes, a struggle in which the subservient class actively involves itself in the creation of structures that sustain its submissive role. If this chain of subservience begins with the labour process, it is connected to working-class life by links forged by workers themselves.

Donald H. Akenson, ed., *Canadian Papers in Rural History*, Volume IV (Gananoque, Ontario: Langdale Press 1984).

THESE ANNUAL papers grow in size and quality year-by-year. The 1984 edition is, like its predecessors, an eclectic mine for Canadian social historians. Labour historians will find Ian MacPherson's and John Herd Thompson's discussion of Prairie agriculture during World War II useful, for it includes a discussion of wartime regulation of an unruly agricultural labour market. Those concerned with working-class communities in the nineteenth century will benefit from perspectives and methods employed by Darrell A. Norris's look at migration, settlement and the life course in Euphrasia Township, Grey County, Canada West, while Glenn J. Lockwood's study of the persistence of the Irish of Montague Township supports Akenson's earlier arguments that the Irish were not simply driven to wage labour in industrializing Ontario. Nevertheless, in spite of the apparent arrivals of urban and rural history, the latter following respectfully the former, it is all too clear that the important relationships between these two spheres form a point of intersection of vital importance to labour historians. It is at the point of connection between these now two separate spheres, for instance, that we can glimpse the formation of a market society and the structural making of a working class. Yet the divisions remain. Surely it is time to write the histories of town and country as they evolved, as part of a totality of transformation.

E. Blanche Norcross, ed., *The Company on the Coast* (Nanaimo: Nanaimo Historical Society, 1983)

THIS SLIM VOLUME contains one essay of interest to labour historians. In "Miners and Managers: The Organization of Coal Production on Vancouver Island by the Hudson's Bay Company, 1848-1862," H. Keith Raiston puts some flesh on the bones of our knowledge of conflict in the early extraction of coal. He explores the struggles over labour disci-

pline that pitted early immigrant miners against Douglas and the Hudson's Bay Company, resulting in a series of conflicts and negotiations between 1849-51. Most of the original group of miners simply deserted their posts at Fort Rupert. By 1853 the Nanaimo seams were being developed and difficulties with a newly-arrived group of miners persisted, prompting one official to urge the sale of the mine. Not until company rule was ended would Vancouver Island's coal resources, increasingly associated with the name of Dunsmuir, be exploited effectively.

Ralph Miliband, *Class Power & State Power: Political Essays* (London: Verso Editions 1983).

THIS VOLUME GATHERS together sixteen of Miliband's political and analytic essays, the bulk of which were written between 1970 and 1983. Most appeared in *The Socialist Register* and *New Left Review*. They are grouped in three related sections, concerned with the nature of the capitalist state, Marxism's capacity to address the problem of power, and the particular prospects for class struggle and socialist advance in contemporary Britain. Ranging broadly over the political culture of modern socialism, Miliband comments on Kofakowski, Bahro, Bettelheim, Medvedev, the lessons of Chile, the disarmament campaign, and the crisis of Labour Party electoralism. Through all of this Miliband is concerned to reach past current paralysis of the left. Socialism, he notes, has been with us, effectively, for more than a century and needs to be with us for the next 100 years as well. We can insure that, he concludes, by going back to the origins of socialist propaganda, when the slogan of the SDF, "Educate, Agitate, Organize" rallied many to the class power that promised a new state power.

Immanuel Wallerstein, ed., *Labor in the World Social Structure*, Volume 2 (Beverly Hills: Sage 1983).

THIS RATHER UNEVEN collection of essays on class formation and workers' movements in the core and peripheral economies of Wallerstein's world system is notable for the range of its concerns and for the unique attempt to bring together perspectives from various disciplines and ideological blocs. Historians and sociologists from the United States and specialists associated with the Institute for the Study of International Labor Movements of the U.S.S.R. Academy of Sciences contributed to the volume. Mark Selden's "The Proletariat, Revolutionary Change, and the State in China and Japan, 1850-1950," is an exciting and lengthy synthesis that all labour historians could read with profit. North American historians will find Melvyn Dubofsky's overview of workers' movements in the United States since 1873 a useful study, highlighting, as it does, a periodization of class conflict and the consequent shifts in consciousness and state policy that are together essential components of labour's changing history. In a thoughtful introduction David Montgomery points to the divergent perspectives of East and West. While American authors stress the impact of a Braverman degradation of work, Soviet writers lay stress upon the "scientific-cultural revolution" and look at the rising educational levels required for basic labour.

William I. Thomas and Florian Znaniecki, *The Polish Peasant in Europe and America*, edited and abridged by Eli Zaretsky, (Urbana: University of Illinois Press 1984).

A CLASSIC PIECE of American sociological inquiry is now reprinted, available in a shortened edition. Zaretsky's introduction correctly places *The Polish Peasant* in a select group of studies that defined sociological inquiry for a generation. Stressing the interplay of objective and subjective forces, Thomas and Znaniecki were also concerned with large theoretical

issues, especially the massive shifts in social life that emerged with the spread of industrial capitalism. For almost two decades such concerns captivated American sociological inquiry. Not until an obsessive turn inward towards methodology in the 1940s divorced sociology from its original attempts to understand society, was the intellectual spirit of *The Polish Peasant* buried in quantitative, positivist, and behaviourist research of post-war sociology. It has fallen to radical social historians to resurrect the concerns, if not the conclusions of, *The Polish Peasant*.

Geoffrey Crossick and Heinz-Gerhard Haupt, eds., *Shopkeepers and Master Artisans in Nineteenth-Century Europe* (London: Methuen 1984).

INDUSTRIAL CAPITALISM revamped the social relations of production between 1850-1914. But as this collection stresses it did not, with one well-directed blow, wipe out the petty bourgeoisie. This "forgotten class" is scrutinized in a series of general national studies encompassing Germany, Britain, France, and Belgium; six case studies of more discrete aspects of the artisanal and shopkeeping worlds of Europe in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries follow. Geoffrey Crossick's final essay, "shopkeepers and the State in Britain, 1870-1914," strikes an interpretive note of some importance when it concludes: "For all their trade organizations, there is very little sign amongst British shopkeepers of a wider politics, an identity of shopkeepers, a specific relationship to the state as relevant to their problems and to the solution of them." Perhaps the petty bourgeoisie were just what Marx suggested they were.

George Cuomo, *Family Honour: An American Life* (Garden City, New York: Doubleday 1983).

THIS IS A novel of working-class life in America, spanning the years 1911-37.

"Some of the figures who appear," the author states "do so under their own names." Indeed, parts of the book read like a well-researched history, particularly the depictions of John L. Lewis and other labour leaders with whom the book's major subject, Vinny Sirola, interacts. Here, in fictional form, are the immigrant origins of the mass production unionism of the 1930s, the bureaucratization of the CIO drive, the episodic struggles in Flint, and the connective tissues of family and friendship that historians find so illusive but novelists so essential.

Samuel Bamford, *Passages in the Life of a Radical* (Oxford: Oxford University Press 1984).

THIS ATTRACTIVE reprinting of the life of a radical Manchester weaver is a welcome event. Extensively utilized by historians of the great working-class agitations culminating in the Peterloo Massacre, Bamford's book is, along with Place's more self-serving recollections, a source of singular importance.

Perry Anderson, *In the Tracks of Historical Materialism* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press 1984).

THIS THIN TREATISE is a disappointment. It is a continuation, supposedly, of Anderson's previous discussion of the crisis of Western Marxism, but it lacks the innovation and range of his earlier work. It retains that Anderson grasp of synthetic sweep, but is a cosmetic once-over, all too confined to the shelves of New Left books. Most interesting is the chapter "Structure and Subject," where Anderson offers the reader a comment on structuralism's inability to transcend a series of unresolved difficulties and deadlocks within Marxist theory. Just where to turn, however, is a problem. Uncasy with the politics of feminism, ecology, and peace, Anderson remains in the tracks of histori-

cal materialism, casting his lot with the international working-class movement. However much in disarray, he says, it has many days ahead of it still.

Gerard Bekerman, *Marx and Engels: A Conceptual Concordance* (Oxford: Blackwell Reference 1983).

THIS 200-PAGE, \$65.00 volume will find few buyers, but it should be in every library and, indeed, will prove indispensable to those whose research and writing demands a firm grasp of the theory and language of orthodox Marxism. What this clumsily titled translation (the original Paris edition appeared as *Vocabulaire du Marxisme*) does is compile a listing of approximately 675 terms and concepts employed commonly by Marx and Engels. Each headword is then referenced, so that researchers can see where and how Marx and Engels utilized particular terms and contexts. Bekerman's references are admittedly rather arbitrary, and his definition of key writings overly selective. Under lumpenproletariat, for instance, there is no mention of *The Eighteenth Brumaire* while, curiously, the entry for marriage lacks quotes from either the *Communist Manifesto* or *Origins of the Family, Private Property and the State*. This text is thus meant to be used carefully by those who know the classic writings in the field, rather than mined by those searching for a quick and easy entry into Marxist analysis. Cross-references and an excellent index enhance the book's utility.

B.D.P.

Hon. Sir W.F. Coaker, ed., *Twenty Years of the Fishermen's Protective Union of Newfoundland* (St. John's: Creative Printers and Publishers 1984).

THIS NEW REPRINT of Coaker's 1930 classic account is much appreciated, although the photographic reproduction is

not as sharp as it might have been. Equally, a critical introduction reflecting recent scholarship on the FPU would have been a valuable addition. Nevertheless the reissue makes readily available to students and scholars the major source for a reconsideration of the important role of Coaker and the FPU in Newfoundland's history.

G.S.K.

Arnold Pacey, *The Culture of Technology* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell 1983).

ARNOLD PACEY examines some hidden values and assumptions behind the uses of technology. "Culture" is defined here in the limited sense of "values;" "technology" as a "social practice." Labour and social activists may be interested in reading this criticism of the notions of "expertise," "progress," "natural resources,"

"technological imperative." Although there is little original scholarship in this book or any radically new approach to thinking about technology, it is a stimulating and well-written text which may provoke the generation or the fleshing out of interesting hypotheses. Pacey believes "history proceeds by changing the subject" and shifting ideals. In the *Maze of Ingenuity — Ideas and Idealism in the Development of Technology* (London: Allen Lane 1974) he illustrated how technological practices — or "disciplines" — followed shifting intentions and ideas of progress. This earlier book was an excellent counterpoint to narrow economical or internalist interpretations of technological change — and a much richer book than the last. But then "changing the subject" of history is probably a more difficult task.

C. de B.