Ethnologies

ethnologies

On Earth as it is in Heaven: Gothic Revival Churches of Victorian New Brunswick. By Gregg Finley.(Fredericton: Goose Lane Editions, 1995. Pp. 224, illustrations, bibliography, index, $39.95, ISBN 0-86492-175-6 pbk.)

Shane O'Dea

Volume 19, Number 2, 1997

URI: https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1087695ar
DOI: https://doi.org/10.7202/1087695ar

See table of contents

Publisher(s)

Association Canadienne d'Ethnologie et de Folklore

ISSN

1481-5974 (print)
1708-0401 (digital)

Explore this journal

Cite this review

O'Dea, S. (1997). Review of [*On Earth as it is in Heaven: Gothic Revival Churches of Victorian New Brunswick*. By Gregg Finley.(Fredericton: Goose Lane Editions, 1995. Pp. 224, illustrations, bibliography, index, $39.95, ISBN 0-86492-175-6 pbk.)]. *Ethnologies*, *19*(2), 162–164. https://doi.org/10.7202/1087695ar

on the exterior of African-American homes as a result of the process of creolization.

Despite all its short-comings, those inherent in producing an anthology dealing with such a wide range of diverse topics, the book does indicate the enormous complexities of customs associated with death and life, and the importance of Halloween as a "thriving, contemporary, post industrial festival" (p. xxvii). Ideally this book will inspire further research.

ELKE DETTMER
Pouch Cove, Newfoundland

On Earth as it is in Heaven: Gothic Revival Churches of Victorian New Brunswick. By Gregg Finley.(Fredericton: Goose Lane Editions, 1995. Pp. 224, illustrations, bibliography, index, $39.95, ISBN 0-86492-175-6 pbk.)

Studies in architecture can be just that — studies of the aesthetics, the structure or the planning of a building, or all three. But when they are introducing the architecture of a region they must, perforce, be more than art historical; they must take into account geography, folklore, history and, in the case of this book, institutional history in a regional context. New Brunswick Gothic Revival churches include the most important examples of the style in Canada. These are churches that, apart from their intrinsic beauty, have the commanding virtues of being set in glorious surroundings. And it is certainly this sense of beauty in both building and setting that this book captures. Lynn Wiggington's paintings give this book a great strength, which is reinforced by the quality of its design made manifest in the cover, the typeface and the layout.

However, for the person interested in the buildings themselves, in the reality of what she is presenting visually, and what Gregg Finley is writing of, there is a problem with painting as opposed to photography. Anyone concerned with the building is too frequently asking whether or not she has used license here or there in her images. This questioning begins early in the book where the painting of the tower of St. Peter and St. Paul, Bartibog (p. 49) suggests a clapboarded structure — at odds with the text which speaks of "shingle cladding". This breaks trust with the image, a trust which is generally held with photographs (even though they too can be altered). As to the layout, there is only one flaw which must have disturbed the authors when it was first discovered. Each chapter has its first paragraph set a space too close to the next, possibly because the Roman numeral at the head of the chapter was made a point too large to accommodate the text below.

Finley's text highlights the historical coherence of New Brunswick's Victorian church architecture. The remarkable growth of the Gothic Revival in the nineteenth century was the more remarkable when it came to church architecture. In this domain it became — at least for the Church of England — the dominant form. And a dominating form, for it was not merely an architectural choice, it was the visible manifestation of an ideology — the Tractarian ideology. For New Brunswick, this style and its attendant ideology, came and conquered under Bishop Edward Medley.

For Medley, the Tractarian cause was a campaign and he spoke in the language of the battlefield. He saw that the "creation of a See and the building of a Cathedral ...[are] not the *result* but the *means* of conversion. It [is] the first aggressive effort on any new territory which [is] to be subdued for the kingdom of Christ" (p. 103). Medley's colonial notion was of bringing history (in the form of revived medievalism) to a people who had already made their own. And even though the architecture of pagan Rome was considered acceptable given that it was also the architecture of medieval England, it was still perceived as flawed. It was the architecture of medieval Catholic England and the rituals associated with it were too reminiscent of the Roman. Indeed, as Findley reports, an Evangelical enemy saw "Tractarianism ...[as designed to] bring about an accommodation with the Church of Rome ... a conspiracy to exalt the power of the clergy" (p. 106).

There is a wonderful irony in this perception and it encapsulates the problem faced by both Medley in New Brunswick and Bishop Field in Newfoundland. Leaving aside matters of style and ritual, the other major battlefront for the local (generally Evangelical) community and the Tractarian imports involved the issue of pew rents and the power struggle inherent therein. Pew rents paid for church construction and helped support the minister. In paying for his or her pew, the parishioner was given a place — a clearly defined place which established a parish hierarchy. The Tractarian bishops did not sanction such discrimination which generally involved exclusion of the poor; they wanted free seating. So we see quasi-democratic congregational power ranged against a paternalistic and autocratic hierarchy. It is also interesting to note that these quarrels are frequently expressed as disputes between pro- and anti-Catholic tendencies — but the real battle was over local control, a battle which Catholics in the Maritimes had already fought in the trusteeism issue of the 1820s. Given his very full knowledge of the relevant documents, Finley is able to present these issues in a thorough, balanced manner.

It is very interesting to see how church architecture not only makes religious but also social statements. In his comments on the mainstreaming of the Methodists (p. 171-2), Finley makes the point that they put aside their perception of the Gothic as Romanist and accepted its association with the establishment, its social cachet. Once the Methodists had become established themselves, once they felt they had become full members of their communities,

they began to build in the established style: the Gothic Revival, or a variant of it.

Shane O'Dea
Memorial University of Newfoundland
St. John's, Newfoundland

Recording Oral History: a Practical Guide for Social Scientists. By Valerie Raleigh Yow. (Thousand Oaks: Sage, 1994. Pp. xi + 283, bibliography, ISBN 0-8039-5578-2 cloth, 0-8039-5579-0 pbk.)

Aside from one important omission, this is a thorough and well-organized compendium of how-to hints and thoughtful reflections, based upon the author's very considerable experience and her acquaintance with the writings of American oral historians.

The book is aimed at practitioners of the in-depth interview. This is defined here as being not the diagnostic nor the focussed type of interview, but one which is more open-ended, less directed: the kind of interchange which gives an interviewer maximum opportunity to learn the varied, often unique ways in which respondents recall and contextualize their memories. Technical chapters follow the introduction, dealing with preparations for an oral history project — selecting and contacting narrators, assembling the equipment — and interviewing techniques. A section on "Building Rapport" with respondents is wisely twinned with one on "Diminishing Rapport", something the unwary interviewer can also manage to produce if he or she is not careful enough. Several "how-not-to" examples are highlighted. The major guideline is always to show interest in what a narrator is telling you, but never to judge.

Linked to these ideas is her very successful chapter on "Interpersonal Relations in the Interview". It succinctly outlines the effects of race, gender, age, class, ethnicity and subculture on how questions will be heard, how therefore they should be posed, and the answers interpreted.

Then, writes Yow, one must step "with full attention" into the matter of legalities and ethics, "like a cat about to go into a yard full of dogs" (p. 84). We do not want to step in anything, nor be chased or bitten. She makes it clear that ethical dilemmas — consent, anonymity, advocacy, reputations — are more important and more difficult than legal issues of copyright, privacy or libel. Her mastery of the whole continuum from popular culture to arcane scholarship is most evident in examples cited here. They range from the high-profile finding of libel against Janet Malcolm, after she had conducted 40 hours of interviews, for misquoting Jeffrey Masson in her 1983 *New Yorker* articles, to difficulties Memorial University anthropologist Jean Briggs had in