English Studies in Canada

Rita Bode, Lesley D. Clement, E. Holly Pike, and Margaret Steffler, eds. Children and Childhoods in L.M. Montgomery: Continuing Conversations

Idette Noomé

Volume 47, Number 4, December 2021

URI: https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1112750ar
DOI: https://doi.org/10.1353/esc.2021.a932544

See table of contents

Publisher(s)

Association of Canadian College and University Teachers of English (ACCUTE)

ISSN

0317-0802 (print)
1913-4835 (digital)

Explore this journal

Cite this review

Noomé, I. (2021). Review of [Rita Bode, Lesley D. Clement, E. Holly Pike, and Margaret Steffler, eds. Children and Childhoods in L.M. Montgomery: Continuing Conversations]. *English Studies in Canada*, *47*(4), 151–158. https://doi.org/10.1353/esc.2021.a932544

reportage (and spatialization) of sieges. Moreover, the choice to limit the study to the civil wars period and after means that the English experience of siege warfare on the continent, particularly in the sieges of the Dutch wars of independence, in the late sixteenth and early seventeenth century, is also not included, even though those experiences constituted some of the defining early experiences of siege warfare for the English in the early modern period, not only for English soldiers involved in the war against Spain but also for the English at home reading siege pamphlets. Nonetheless, Alker and Nelson rightly call our attention to the siege as a literary topic of enduring significance. Their book invites us to rethink war literature and opens new avenues for research.

Su Fang Ng
Virginia Tech

Rita Bode, Lesley D. Clement, E. Holly Pike, and Margaret Steffler, eds. *Children and Childhoods in L.M. Montgomery: Continuing Conversations*. McGill-Queen's UP, 2022. 338 pp. $140.00 / $39.95 (pb).

This collection of twelve scholarly studies and four original writings on beloved Canadian author L.M. Montgomery is a *tour de force*, adding to the wonderful array of scholarly criticism on Montgomery in the McGill-Queen's University Press stable. The word "converse," derived from the Latin *conversari*, "keep company (with)," and the Late Middle English *converse*, to "live among, be familiar with," as the leitmotif of this volume is very apt. All the authors have indeed kept company with Montgomery, as evidenced in their empathetic and superbly meticulous analyses of the dialogues between Montgomery and her younger self, her present and her past, and Montgomery and her own reading, as well as the dialogues of other authors with her. Fans of *Anne of Green Gables* and *Emily of New Moon* and their sequels will find their favourites well covered. The collection also adds to awareness around other Montgomery novels, especially the previously understudied *Magic for Marigold*. Several chapters trace how other writers have reacted to Montgomery's characters and ideas and responded to them in their own creations and characters. Chapters on anime, fanfiction, and adaptation for television are also included. The "Afterlives" offer unique direct short conversations where creative artists show such conversations in action.

The first part, "Conversing with the Past: Vulnerability, Resistance, and Resilience," considers Montgomery's ongoing conversation with what she read, often documented in her journals. Kate Scarth posits in "*Emily of New Moon* and *Fanny of Mansfield Park: Childhood at Home in Jane Austen and L.M. Montgomery*" that the orphaned outsiders Emily and Fanny manage to "carve out a domestic space they can call home" (15). Sensitive reading and rigorous comparison of the novels brings *Mansfield Park* into the conversation on Montgomery. Both characters prepare for a bigger life, Fanny led by her moral compass, Emily by her urge to become a writer. Scarth draws on critical literary geography to tease out the gendered social dimensions and "vital materiality" (31) of these characters' rooms of their own. The consideration of the letters in both novels adds another suggestive avenue, resonating with the discussion of letters in other chapters in the collection. Lesley D. Clement, in "L.M. Montgomery's Precocious Children: Resisting Adult Narratives of Death, Dying, and the Afterlife," argues that Montgomery rescripts mortality and death following her early rejection of simplistic visions of heaven and her reading of Phelps's *The Gates Ajar*. The incisive chapter, focusing on the *Anne* series and *Magic for Marigold*, interfaces with scholarship on the domestication of death in the nineteenth century and children's exposure to the concept. Clement investigates the ultimate resilience and retention of vitality and curiosity of child characters despite multiple deaths in the novels. These children use the strategy of enacting stories of death, exploiting the gothic thrill, making them what Marah Gubar calls "artful collaborators" in the quest for agency (49). The realization of death is a rite of passage faced by Anne and Emily. Unlike Roberta Trites, Clement sees children (characters and readers) as capable of negotiating social and cultural networks, especially when the stories of death are combined with explorations of love and belonging. Montgomery's life-writing records loss, but her fiction often combines death scenes (real or performed) with humour, leaving characters and readers in "open-ended conversations on death, dying, and an afterlife" (58). "Vulnerable Situations: Boys and Boyhood in the *Emily* Books" by Rita Bode offers a welcome addition to Montgomery scholarship by focusing on some of the largely understudied male characters. Bode argues convincingly that the writing of the *Emily* books coincided with Montgomery's rising interest in boyhood as her sons started to grow up, making her intensely aware that boys, like girls, face intense vulnerability in their journey toward adulthood. The chapter shows Montgomery in conversation and at variance with other authors, educators, and social scientists writing on boyhood, "boy-study" and "boyology," offering a fas-

cinating contextualization of Montgomery's personal interest in books around rearing boys, including *The Boy Problem* (1901), by American Quaker William Byron Forbush, *Boyology, or Boy Analysis* (1916) by YMCA leader William Henry Gibson, and work by psychologist Granville Stanley Hall. Bode discusses four sources of vulnerability: physical injury (Cousin Jimmy), psychological trauma arising from disability (Dean Priest), being orphaned and impoverished (Perry), and possessive parenting (Teddy Kent). Her tracing of the sources of Dean's cynical attitude and Byronic self-positioning to boyhood wounding offers a more balanced reading of this oft-maligned character. She locates Perry Miller in a literary tradition of "bad boys" who survive to become successful, but she also reads him as a "barometer of the intolerance and prejudice operating in the community" (83). For Teddy, who has to negotiate obsessive parenting, Bode's illuminating reading rehabilitates a character whose status as Emily's romantic partner some readers and scholars have questioned.

The second part of the book looks at conversations concerning fantasy, the ideal, and the real. In "The Performance of the Beautiful Dream Boy in Novels by L.M. Montgomery and Frances Hodgson Burnett," Margaret Steffler explores the cult of the beautiful dream boy, epitomized in Burnett's Cedric Errol in *Little Lord Fountleroy* and the wholesome Dickon Sowerby in *The Secret Garden*. Steffler draws on Germaine Greer, Judith Butler, and James R. Kincaid to interrogate Montgomery's own curious identification of a dream boy in the young Kenneth Ritchie, whom she met in 1910. He became the prototype for Paul Irving in *Anne of Avonlea*, Anne's son Walter Blythe, and Teddy Kent in the *Emily* series. Steffler's complex discussion includes the counterpart to the dream boy, the fictional Davy Keith, and Montgomery's own real sons, who cannot be fixed in the mould of the pure, world-transforming dream boy. The transformative power, she contends, lies in the power to convert loneliness through love to release even the adults trapped in disappointment. The chapter complements Bode's discussion on the vulnerability of boys, considering Montgomery's own resistance to her sons transitions away from the innocence of babyhood toward the complexity of independence, agency, and, disturbingly, the ability to lie (linking to Warnqvist's discussion of Pippi Longstocking later). Bonnie J. Tulloch, in "Lost Boys and Lost Girls: the Kindred Offspring of J.M. Barrie and L.M. Montgomery" tackles vexed questions regarding the limits of children's literature, the roles of children and childhood, and the alleged incompatibility of childhood and adulthood as separate stages of existence. Tulloch posits that both Barrie's *Peter Pan* and Montgomery's *Anne of Green Gables* allow readers (and the authors)

to "question the logic of the cultural roles that defined their lives as adults" (114) and to re-access experiences supposedly lost to adults once they grew up. The chapter engages explicitly with definitions of children and childhood, including some legal definitions—constructions which contrast the Romantic notions of innocence, natural piety, and imaginative play with the reality, work, and sense supposedly associated with adults. Tulloch compares Montgomery's and Barrie's novels and personal writings about imagination as narrative "laboratories" (118) to oppose limiting role constructs. In "*Magic for Marigold*, Childhood and Fiction," E. Holly Pike explores Montgomery's creation of metafictive space. Drawing on Montgomery's own responses to letters in the Charlottetown *Guardian* of 1930, she reads the novel as a conversation between the author and her critics regarding the nature of fiction. Montgomery defended her depiction of Prince Edward Island and Marigold's family as both fictional and true, suggesting that she drew on both realism *and* created a fictional child who is "ageless" in her imagination and enjoyment of a magical world. She rejected a "realism" focused only on the "latrine" or "pigsty" and the sexually explicit. Pike's sensitive analysis of tenses, wording, the location in past and present, realism and romance, the child, and the shared knowledge of adult audiences in this novel is a delightful demonstration of Montgomery's narrative sophistication.

The third part, "Continuing Literary Conversations: Transformative Relationships and Spaces" focuses on interfaces between Montgomery's work and that of Swedish author Astrid Lindgren and American writer Madeleine L'Engle, as well as between Montgomery's Anne and recent popular heroines. In "Loving, Larking, and Lying: Free-spirited Children and Disciplinary Adults in the Works of L.M. Montgomery and Astrid Lindgren," Åsa Warnqvist shows how Lindgren's Pippi Longstocking takes to another level Montgomery's progressive concern with the outcomes when "imaginative children are brought in contact with disciplinary adults" (159). Lindgren, who loved *Anne of Green Gables*, gave her own red-headed protagonist complete autonomy, questioning adult dictates regarding children's socialization. Warnqvist draws on Bakhtin's dialogism, filtered through the theory of Swedish literary scholar Kjell Espmark regarding dialogues between texts, which sees "allusions and references to another author's works as 'responses'" (160). Considering Montgomery's own background, and Lindgren's probable exposure to Bertrand Russell's *Education and the Good Life* (1926), which was translated into Swedish by 1933, Warnqvist compares Anne and Pippi: Anne adjusts, but Pippi breaks all norms to represent an extreme autonomous, free child. Warnqvist also

compares Montgomery's Anne and Lindgren's Ann in "Under the Cherry Tree" (1950), concluding that unlike Montgomery, Lindgren "condones lying" (not mere imaginative fictionalizing) "as the right of free, imaginative children" (168). Insightful parallels are drawn between *Emil i Lönneberga* (1963), the mischievous Davy Keith in *Anne of Avonlea*, and Lionel Hezekiah in the short story "The Miracle at Carmody" (1912). In "Absent Fathers: Conversations between L.M. Montgomery and Madeleine L'Engle," Heidi A. Lawrence shows how both authors rescripted their idealization of their respective fathers and father-daughter relationships, storying and curating the narrative in their life-writing and novels, contextualizing her argument in broader discussions around the absence or presence of fathers in the domestic sphere. Both authors' father-loss culminated in the final traumatic abandonment of their fathers' deaths, for Montgomery when she was twenty-five, for L'Engle when she was seventeen. Lawrence focuses on the *Emily* books (which L'Engle adored), and L'Engle's *The Small Rain* and *A Wrinkle in Time*. In "Transformative Girlhood and Twenty-first-century Girldom in L.M. Montgomery's *Anne of Green Gables*," William V. Thompson considers girlhood as the space in which girls find their voice, "the effects of which extend into the public and political realms" (219). Positioning his argument in a formidable array of scholarship on what precisely constitutes a "girl" and "girlhood," on *Anne of Green Gables* and its sequels, and girlhood studies, Thompson argues that Montgomery positions Anne in interaction with a cultural community that attempts to circumscribe her femininity and sexuality to construct her girlhood. In claiming her space in the imaginative, natural, domestic, and scholastic space, Anne finds the belonging she desires and her own voice. He offers a particularly persuasive analysis of the shift in the narrative focus in *Anne of Green Gables* from the adult voices (particularly the view through Marilla's eyes) to Anne's own. Links between Anne and Suzanne Collins's Katniss in the *Hunger Games* trilogy, J.K. Rowling's Hermione Granger in the *Harry Potter* series, and Disney's Elsa in *Frozen* open up the conversation around these female figures interacting with the cultural forces that seek to contain their identities in dominant homogenizing discourses.

The first chapter in the fourth part of the collection, "Continuing Transmediated Conversations: *Anime*, Fanfiction, and Television Adaptations" offers behind-the-scenes insights into the making of the 2007 *anime* series *Kaze no Shoujo Emiri* [*Emily, Girl of the Wind*]. Yoshiko Akamatsu, literary consultant on the series, unpacks details chosen to resonate culturally with the Japanese audience and appeal to all age groups, including the extension into Emily's married life and motherhood, and the emphasis on the

Künstlerroman angle, the romance with Teddy, and the development of Emily's Wind Woman. Key requirements included making the series speak to the career aspirations of girls in the twenty-first century and nostalgia for a simpler life and spring imagery relating to the natural beauty of Prince Edward Island. This chapter is a must-read for those who love *anime* and Montgomery. Balaka Basu's chapter on Montgomery fanfiction in the digital era considers some of the "sequels" for the novels and how writers rework the novels' endings, fill gaps, and take on the heteronormativity by exploring same sex relationships for characters. Basu takes a positive view of fanfiction, arguing that the genre crosses boundaries "in an ongoing exchange of responses" (242) to Montgomery, and she offers multiple persuasive examples that show that both Montgomery and her character Emily (a budding author) actually write fanfiction themselves in a form of "ludic narrative composition" (245). Basu's samples of the fanfiction invite readers to enjoy the genre. Laura M. Robinson's discussion "Anne with an Edge: CBC-Netflix's Rereading of Montgomery's *Anne of Green Gables*" is an appropriate conclusion to the section, connecting adaptation and the gap-filling qualities of fanfiction. She raises the question of whether the darker reading of Anne and her back story, which foregrounds the trauma present in the story, leaves viewers with any hope or vision for the future. Robinson highlights creator Moira Walley-Beckett's embedding of the discourses of girlhood in the nexus of contestation, vulnerability, and empowerment (257), connecting the Netflix series to the present sociopolitical moment. Like Basu, Robinson suggests that Montgomery herself plays with rewriting, demonstrated by her adoption of the orphan genre and by intertextual games with her literary forebears. However, Robinson goes further than Basu in considering the function of iteration and allowing texts (including the lyrics of the series' title music) to inform each other. She convincingly demonstrates how the disruption of the pastoral idyll associated with *Anne of Green Gables* opens up transformative avenues to overcome "chronic woundedness" (265).

The eclectic set of "Afterwords"—immersive conversations with Montgomery—flows organically from the scholarly conversations throughout the book, especially Basu's and Robinson's chapters. Editors Lesley Clement and Margaret Steffler describe these works as "new conversations from contemporary performers and writers" (277). These original works convey the authors' admiration of Montgomery and sense of kinship with her and her characters' message of hope in the face of difference and the desire for belonging. Finnish scholar Vappu Kannas interviews Satu Koskimies and Vilja-Tuulia Huotarinen, whose novel *Emilia Kent—Runotytön tarina*

jatkuu, akin to fanfiction, constructs the life of Emily of New Moon as a wife and mother. Next, actor, singer-songwriter, author, and director Holly Cinnamon writes about playing Anne of Green Gables, negotiating labels of difference relating to Anne's gender and poverty, the loss of her biological parents, her appearance (including freckles and the famous red hair), and "queerness." Cinnamon revels in the magic of Anne's world "where all beings are witnessed, dignified, and loved in the beauty of their complicated fullness" (291). The evocative poem concluding Cinnamon's section captures both the whimsy of Anne's imagination and the underlying resilience and integrity of the character. I was once privileged to enjoy a performance on Prince Edward Island by the talented Rosalee Peppard Lockyer, writer, singer, songwriter, and musical women's oral-historian, so I was delighted by the inclusion of her poem "My Maud by Katie Maurice." She explains that Anne's imaginary friend Katie Maurice offers a "door" to Anne and to Montgomery. The phrase "this stray woman child" becomes the keynote for a poem spoken by Katie to Maud/Anne as Katie is left behind but later regained. The editors' juxtaposition of this poem with Cinnamon's highlights the strength found in communication and community between the self and other in the bigger journey outward and inward. This poem also picks up the motif of female friendships in Montgomery's work. The section concludes with a tribute to Montgomery by award-winning author Kit Pearson, who describes herself as Montgomery's "protégé" (301). Her testimony shows her engagement first with Montgomery's Emily and later with Anne (perhaps the reverse of many readers' encounters with the characters), her reading and rereading, and inner conversations with these texts.

The volume has several strengths. For me, the greatest of these is the meticulous close reading of Montgomery's work that has become a hallmark of the scholarship on this author. The eye-opening attention to detail uncovers delightful nuances, urging readers to go back to the novels and journals to continue their own journeys with the author. Another strength is the way the chapters speak to each other and to the "Afterlives." The authors themselves point to ways in which their chapters link to each other, but readers will notice many more areas in which the arguments complement each other. The erudite scholarship represented here is enhanced by the professionalism and experience of the volume editors, all of whom have co-edited previous collections of studies on Montgomery. Their seamless integration of the entire book, starting with the road-map provided by their thought-provoking introduction, makes this book a pleasure to read from beginning to end. It is accessible, detailed, and engaging, unfold-

ing new views of Montgomery's many children—delightful, resilient, and imaginative—to invite us to join in the magic of a dialogue with her, her characters, and the authors and scholars and artists who have already joined the conversation.

Idette Noomé
University of Pretoria

Albert Braz and Paul D. Morris, eds. *National Literature in Multinational States*. University of Alberta Press, 2022. xxix + 206 pp.

The crux of this collection of new essays by a group of scholars now working in Canadian universities is perhaps best summed up in a sentence found in Jerry White's "Rediscovering the Republic: The Work of Joan Daniel Bezsonoff." As its title implies, White's essay addresses the nationalist sentiment in *Catalonia Nord*, that is, French Catalonia. In one passage, he cites Llorenç Planes's invocation of "*els jacobins barcelonins*" as an apt illustration of a Catalan-based nationalism that was opposed to the more Parisian "pluralist and universalist" national identity that Bezsonoff favoured, in which regional difference would happily co-exist with the republican ideal (131–32). White then remarks that Planes's ethnically based separatism "also calls to mind … the post-Revolutionary France's experience of consolidating a new national identity, one that put republican universalism in the place of an older, semi-feudal system that, nevertheless, made space for ethnic and linguistic difference" (132). White addresses a structural problem raised by republican nationalism within one of the "old" nations of Europe. But the tension he locates between the unified republican idea of post–Revolution France and the messier congeries of the *ancien régime*, where widely divergent dialects, ethnicities, and traditions might be found only a few villages apart, applies equally well to all the other essays in the volume, which address the "new" nations of the postcolonial world. Of the five national/cultural contexts discussed over ten essays—Canada (Paul D. Morris, Matthew Cormier, Matthew Tétreault, Sabujkoli Bandopadhyay, Asma Sayed), India (Bandopadhyay, Clara A.B. Joseph), the Dutch Caribbean (Doris Hambuch), French Catalonia (White), and Nigeria (Albert Braz, Uchechukwu Peter Umezurike)—all excepting White either explicitly or implicitly explore the dilemma posed by the limitations of postcolonial national identity on the diversity of literary culture.