

# The Religious History of Atlantic Canada: The State of the Art

Terrence Murphy

Volume 15, Number 1, Autumn 1985

URI: [https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/acad15\\_1rv03](https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/acad15_1rv03)

[See table of contents](#)

---

## Publisher(s)

The Department of History of the University of New Brunswick

## ISSN

0044-5851 (print)

1712-7432 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

---

## Cite this document

Murphy, T. (1985). The Religious History of Atlantic Canada:: The State of the Art. *Acadiensis*, 15(1), 152–174.

contemporary debate over Maritime political economy, it is of at least equal value to the edition as the Saunders study itself. By way of conclusion, there is a need for more reprints and inexpensive monograph-length studies on all areas of Maritime and Atlantic Canada studies. Given the shortage of teaching materials and the expansion of graduate and undergraduate courses in all areas of the study of the region, publishers should be encouraged to put a priority on making such materials available.

MICHAEL CLOW

### The Religious History of Atlantic Canada: The State of the Art

THE EARLY 1970s MARKED A TURNING-POINT in the historiography of religion in the Atlantic Provinces. In a space of less than two years, three books appeared which seemed to herald a new and more critical approach to the study of the region's religious traditions. These books were J.M. Bumsted, *Henry Alline* (1971), Judith Fingard, *The Anglican Design in Loyalist Nova Scotia* (1972), and Gordon Stewart and George Rawlyk, *A People Highly Favoured of God: the Nova Scotia Yankees and the American Revolution*,<sup>1</sup> (1972). Until then, it had been necessary for students of the religious experience in the region to rely mainly on denominational histories, books which contained valuable information but were written from a confessional point of view and made limited or selective use of primary sources.<sup>2</sup> The standard scholarly works on Atlantic regional history concentrated on political, military and economic developments, and religion was mentioned incidentally, if at all. Virtually the only academic studies of religious history were Maurice Armstrong, *The Great Awakening in Nova Scotia, 1776-1809*, and S.D. Clark, *Church and Sect in Canada*, both of which had appeared in 1948. These works were characterized by thorough research, by critical rather than sectarian methods, and by attempts to relate religious developments to the general history of the region. Yet several years passed before anyone ventured to carry on where Armstrong and Clark left off. In 1962 Goldwin French published *Parsons and Politics*, a comparative study of

1 For a review of these three works, see Goldwin French, "Religion and Society in Late Eighteenth Century Nova Scotia", *Acadiensis*, IV, 2 (Spring 1975), pp. 102-10. For other surveys of more recent work in the field see Barry Moody, "Religious History: The State of the Craft in the Maritime Provinces", *Journal of the Canadian Church Historical Society*, XXV, 2 (October 1983), pp. 93-5, and Fernand Arsenault, "L'Eglise Catholique en Acadie: Etat de la recherche", *Revue de l'Université de Moncton*, XV, 2 (janvier-mars 1982), pp. 105-17.

2 For example, E.M. Saunders, *History of the Baptists of the Maritime Provinces* (Halifax, 1902), George E. Levy, *The Baptists of the Maritime Provinces: 1753-1946* (Saint John, 1946), William Gregg, *History of the Presbyterian Church in the Dominion of Canada*, (Toronto, 1885), William Gregg, *Short History of the Presbyterian Church in the Dominion of Canada* (Toronto, 1892), T.W. Smith, *Methodism in Eastern British America* (Halifax, 1877).

Methodism in the Maritimes and Upper Canada, but another decade followed without the appearance of a significant scholarly work.

The three important studies of the early 1970s raised hopes that this long-neglected field would finally be cultivated in earnest. And indeed the years which have followed their appearance have seen a growing crop of books and articles on the religious history of Atlantic Canada. These works are of mixed quality, but there can be no doubt that our knowledge of the topic has grown considerably. Varying degrees of progress have been made in the following areas: the role of religion in the first European settlements in the Atlantic colonies, the religious development of the Acadians after the exile, the rise of English-speaking Catholics as one of the region's major religious groups, and the history of the Protestant dissenting churches. Still, the topic which has continued to receive more attention than any other is the story of Henry Alline and the Great Awakening.

The reason for this is not only the intrinsic interest of the events but also the historiographical debate which they have provoked. The Great Awakening has brought into focus the questions of how historians should interpret religious experience and of how great a role they should assign to it in explaining the region's development. Maurice Armstrong's work was crucial here, for he was the first to argue that religious circumstances deserved to be taken into account in assessing the neutrality of Nova Scotia during the American Revolution. To appreciate his accomplishment, it is necessary to read *The Great Awakening in Nova Scotia* in conjunction with an article published two years earlier, in which he criticized J.B. Brebner for concentrating exclusively on military and economic circumstances.<sup>3</sup> Surprisingly, Gordon Stewart and George Rawlyk later expressed dissatisfaction with his interpretation, which they described as "simply an extended footnote to the Brebner thesis".<sup>4</sup> In their view, Armstrong had seen the Great Awakening too much as an escape from the grim realities of warfare and had ignored its positive effects in helping anxious New England immigrants achieve a new sense of identity. This criticism was not entirely fair. In the first place, Armstrong not only stressed the escapist dimension of the religious revival, but also insisted that it involved an element of self-assertion and revolt against authority.<sup>5</sup> In the second place, he clearly deserves the credit for the basic insight that religion and neutrality were closely linked among the Nova Scotia Yankees. To a greater extent than they seemed to appreciate, Stewart and Rawlyk were building on foundations which Armstrong had laid. It is true, however, that by a closer analysis of conditions during the revolutionary period and especially by emphasizing the theme of "identity", they were able to show more clearly the formative influence of religion on Maritime society.

3 Maurice W. Armstrong, "Neutrality and Religion in Revolutionary Nova Scotia", *The New England Quarterly*, XIX, 1 (March 1946), pp. 50-62; reprinted in George A. Rawlyk, ed., *Historical Essays on the Atlantic Provinces* (Toronto, 1967), pp. 33-43.

4 Stewart and Rawlyk, *A People Highly Favoured of God*, p. xx.

5 Armstrong, "Neutrality and Religion", pp. 58-9.

Rawlyk has now added a new twist to the historiography of the Great Awakening with the publication of his 1983 Hayward Lectures, *Ravished by the Spirit: Religious Revivals, Baptists and Henry Alline* (Kingston and Montreal, McGill-Queen's University Press, 1984).<sup>6</sup> He frankly rejects some features of his earlier work, especially the tendency to regard Henry Alline's message as an essentially trivial one which gained importance temporarily, only because of the unusual context in which it was proclaimed. Rawlyk now goes almost to the opposite extreme, extolling Alline's contributions as an evangelist, hymn-writer, poet and theologian and calling for a greater recognition of the impact of his ideas. His new approach is less original than it might seem, because when *A People Highly Favoured of God* appeared, with its social-psychological interpretation of the Great Awakening, J.M. Bumsted was already insisting that the revival should be taken seriously as a movement of spiritual reform.<sup>7</sup> Implicit in Bumsted's description of Alline's career was a rejection of reductionist theories of religion, whereas Rawlyk's revised opinions arise from a growing sympathy on his part for evangelical forms of Christianity.<sup>8</sup>

The chief value of *Ravished by the Spirit* is that by emphasizing Alline's post-humous influence, it shifts attention to the neglected period after 1784. Although the first of Rawlyk's four lectures deals with Alline's conversion and preaching, the remaining three are devoted to developments after his death; and it is here that new material is introduced. The second lecture, for example, describes the "symbiotic relationship" that existed between the New Light movement in Nova Scotia and the Free Will Baptists of New England. Supported by the research of Stephen Marini on radical sects in revolutionary New England,<sup>9</sup> Rawlyk is able to show that Alline had a major influence on both the theology and spirituality of the Free Will Baptists. He also points out that by a twist of fate, Free Will Baptist missionaries who carried Alline's gospel back to Nova Scotia in the 19th century found themselves attacked by his supposed spiritual descendants, who had by that time become Calvinistic Baptists.

The third lecture in the series is concerned precisely with the reasons for this transformation of the New Light movement into the Baptist denomination. Rawlyk assigns a central role to the Second Great Awakening, a popular revival which swept the New Light centres between 1790 and 1810. This was a period when important changes were occurring in Maritime society because of the Loyalist immigration, and Rawlyk draws a strong connection between this social upheaval and the outburst of religious enthusiasm. This line of reasoning is reminiscent of his earlier work, but he takes greater care than before not to

6 Some of the main ideas in this book were previously outlined in G.A. Rawlyk, "New Lights, Baptists and Religious Awakenings in Nova Scotia. 1776-1843: A Preliminary Probe", *Journal of the Canadian Church Historical Society*, XXV, 2 (October 1983), pp. 43-73.

7 Bumsted, *Henry Alline*, p. 68. Bumsted, p. 56, had also commented on the high quality of some of Alline's hymns.

8 Rawlyk, *Ravished by the Spirit*, pp. ix-xi.

9 S.A. Marini, *Radical Sects of Revolutionary New England* (Cambridge, 1982).

reduce a complex phenomenon to a single cause. He explains how the Second Great Awakening degenerated for a time into antinomianism and how this in turn provoked a corresponding reaction, fostering a desire for order and discipline. It was in the course of the Second Great Awakening that most of Alline's disciples adopted adult baptism as a standard of church membership. By the time the revival had run half its course, a Baptist Association had been formed, partly with a view to checking irregularities.

Rawlyk's last lecture traces the evolution of revivalism among Maritime Baptists during the 19th century. It contains a description of the place of "exhortation" in revival meetings as well as an account of the role played by women and children in arousing religious zeal. The main point of the lecture, however, is that Baptist religious practice, especially in Nova Scotia, became less emotional and pietistic as time went on, a trend which Rawlyk connects with the secularisation of Maritime society in the 20th century.

Atlantic Baptist historiography has received another major boost from the inauguration in 1979 of a series of publications under the general heading "Baptist Heritage in Atlantic Canada". The series is sponsored jointly by Acadia Divinity College and by the Historical Committee of the United Baptist Convention of the Atlantic Provinces. Barry M. Moody has edited a collection entitled *Repent and Believe: The Baptist Experience in Maritime Canada* (Hantsport, N.S., Lancelot Press, 1980), which contains papers delivered at a conference at Acadia University in 1979. Each of the nine essays can be said to shed a degree of light on the history of the Atlantic Baptists, but the two which possess the greatest significance for a general understanding of the topic are George Rawlyk's keynote address, "From New Light to Baptist: Harris Harding and the Second Great Awakening in Nova Scotia", and Barry Moody's paper, "The Maritime Baptists and Higher Education in the Early Nineteenth Century". Rawlyk's contribution covers some of the same ground as his third Hayward Lecture but focuses specifically on the role of Harris Harding. Harding's career illustrates graphically the course of events which unfolded within the New Light-Baptist community between the death of Henry Alline and the end of the Second Great Awakening. Converted in 1785 and soon afterward established as an itinerant preacher, he became deeply involved in the antinomian current of the early 1790s. Later, he seemed to acknowledge the need for order by accepting formal ordination (1794) and baptism (1799). Yet, as Rawlyk says, Baptist church discipline never rested easily on Harding's shoulders. Eventually he became embroiled in the first major controversy to divide the nascent Nova Scotia Baptist Association, a conflict over the "close communion" plan of organization. Harding opposed this scheme on the distinctly Allinite grounds that it attached too much importance to externals. In 1809 three churches with close ties to Harding withdrew from the Baptist Association.

Barry Moody's essay deals with the period almost immediately following this schism, which was likewise a time of transition. From about 1820, Nova Scotia Baptists, led by their clergy, cast off the pietism and anti-intellectualism of their

early years and became convinced of the value of formal education and especially of the benefits of a trained ministry. The practical result was the founding, within the space of a few years, of Horton Academy, the Fredericton Seminary, and Acadia College. These institutions were only the outward manifestation of a deeper change. They reflected a longing for stability, respectability, and access to the means for self-advancement which grew up as the Baptists were transformed from a radical sect into an established denomination. Moody puts these developments into focus very effectively.<sup>10</sup>

Four of the five volumes of sources which have appeared in this series consist of the journals of leading New Light preachers: George E. Levy, ed., *The Diary and Related Writings of the Reverend Joseph Dimock, 1768-1846* (Hantsport, Lancelot Press, 1979); Brian C. Cuthbertson, ed., *The Journal of John Payzant* (Hantsport, Lancelot Press, 1981); James Beverly and Barry Moody, eds., *The Journal of Henry Alline* (Hantsport, Lancelot Press, 1982); D.G. Bell, ed., *New Light Baptist Journals of James Manning and James Innis* (Hantsport, Lancelot Press, 1984). The fifth is a collection of New Light letters and hymns, George A. Rawlyk, ed., *New Light Letters and Spiritual Songs, 1778-1793* (Hantsport, Lancelot Press, 1983).<sup>11</sup> These documents, which are often very repetitive, do not change in any fundamental way our understanding of the Great Awakening or its aftermath. They add considerable detail, however, and when read as a collection, they create a vivid impression of the evangelical piety which flourished in many Maritime communities. The most original material occurs in the volume edited by D.G. Bell, whose long introductions to the diaries of James Manning and James Innis describe events in New Brunswick where the course of Baptist history differed significantly from Nova Scotia. Yet very little of this new information is actually derived from the Manning and Innis journals, which are the least remarkable documents in the entire series. Opinions will continue to vary about the quality of the hymns and poems produced by Alline and his followers, but their popularity testifies to the importance which religious issues took on in the lives of ordinary people. The priority of spiritual over temporal values and the prospect of a glorious reward to compensate for the hardships of this world are among the most prominent themes of New Light literature. The element of escapism in this is obvious. Still, it is hard not to be impressed by the feelings of exaltation and the sense of community which these evangelical Christians achieved through the experience of "new birth". The editors have done a good job of presenting the material. Annotations and references are provided to make the documents easier to follow, and each volume contains an historical introduction as well as an index.

George Rawlyk's former co-author, Gordon Stewart, has also produced a

10 See also Barry Moody, "From Itinerant to Pastor: The Case of Edward Manning, 1767-1851", *Papers of the Canadian Society of Church History*, (1981), pp. 1-25.

11 See also J.M. Bumsted, ed., "The Autobiography of Joseph Crandall", *Acadiensis*, III, 1 (Autumn 1973), pp. 79-96, and B.C. Cuthbertson, "Rev. John Payzant: Henry Alline's Successor", *Collections of the Nova Scotia Historical Society*, XL (1980), pp. 57-80.

recent volume of New Light sources: Gordon T. Stewart, ed., *Documents Relating to the Great Awakening in Nova Scotia, 1760-1791* (Toronto, The Champlain Society, 1982).<sup>12</sup> This collection includes the 1764 return for the township of Yarmouth, evidence of the financial straits of the New England settlers, appeals to New England for support for their churches, the records of the church at Jebogue (Yarmouth township), and excerpts from Henry Alline's journal. All of these documents were used in the preparation of *A People Highly Favoured of God*, and in presenting them here Stewart does not attempt to revise or develop in any way the arguments he had already set forth. In the introduction to the new volume he sometimes repeats word for word passages from his earlier work. The intention behind the new volume seems to be merely to make the documents available in printed form. Yet even this limited undertaking is of dubious value. The brief items at the beginning of the collection are of only slight historical significance, while the publication of excerpts from Alline's journal is redundant, now that the entire work is available. The only strong argument that can be made in favour of the volume is that it is indeed useful to have a printed edition of the so-called "church records" from Jebogue. This is a truly remarkable document which gives by far our most complete account of the development of a Congregational Church in early Nova Scotia, as well as our best glimpse into the excitement and turmoil caused by Henry Alline's preaching. Stewart, however, undermines his own efforts by failing to explain the nature of the document. He does not point out that it is a history rather than "church records" in the normal sense, nor does he explain that it was written by Jonathan Scott, the "Old Light" pastor at Yarmouth and Henry Alline's leading opponent. The significance of the narrative depends almost entirely on the fact that Scott composed it as an *apologia* for his resistance to Alline's ministry.<sup>13</sup>

Other Protestant churches, especially the dissenters, have received far less attention than the New Lights and Baptists, partly because interest has been focused on the Great Awakening and its aftermath and partly because other denominations have shown less initiative than the Baptists in writing their own history. For Methodism, French's *Parsons and Politics* has remained the standard work, while for Presbyterianism, we have had to rely on John Moir, *Enduring Witness: A History of the Presbyterian Church in Canada* (1974), a good survey but by its nature not calculated to explore Atlantic developments in depth. N. Keith Clifford, *The Resistance to Church Union in Canada, 1904-1939* (Vancouver, University of British Columbia Press, 1985), a study of Presbyterian opposition to the formation of the United Church of Canada, is a major contribution to one of the central topics in Canadian religious history. Clifford, a United Churchman, takes a very sympathetic view of the dissidents,

12 For other contributions by Stewart since 1972, see Gordon Stewart, "Socio-Economic Factors in the Great Awakening: The Case of Yarmouth, Nova Scotia", *Acadiensis*, III, 1 (Autumn 1973), pp. 18-34, and "Charisma and Integration: An Eighteenth Century North American Case", *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, XVI, 2 (March 1974), pp. 138-49.

13 For similar criticisms of this work, see D.G. Bell, "All Things New: The Transformation of Maritime Baptist Historiography", *Nova Scotia Historical Review*, IV, 2 (Fall 1984), pp. 73-5.

portraying them as defenders of religious pluralism and liberty.<sup>14</sup> His arguments are original and for the most part convincing, but, like Moir's work, this book is a national study which offers only limited comments on events in the Maritimes. A handful of recent books have been devoted specifically to the history of the Protestant churches in the Atlantic provinces, but, except for the Baptists, this is still a largely neglected field.

First place among the new works belongs to Laurie Stanley, *The Well-Watered Garden: The Presbyterian Church in Cape Breton, 1798-1860* (Sydney, University College of Cape Breton Press, 1983).<sup>15</sup> This remarkable book, originally presented as an M.A. thesis at Dalhousie University, is among the most original contributions to the religious history of Atlantic Canada published in the last decade. Stanley exploits previously untapped sources, especially the records of the Glasgow Colonial Society, to tell the story of Scottish missions among Presbyterian immigrants to Cape Breton. Not only is her research sound, but she manages, through historical imagination and a very expressive style, to bring her subjects to life. We get a vivid impression of the Highland immigrants and their clergy and also of Isabella Gordon Mackay, the redoubtable philanthropist who organized the mission. Among the strengths of Stanley's work is that she effectively relates religious developments in Cape Breton to the Scottish background and at the same time manages to place them in the context of the frontier society created by the settlers.

The early 19th century was a time of religious revival in Scotland, associated with the rise of the evangelical party. This circumstance permeates the entire story of the Cape Breton mission. Isabella Mackay, the missionaries she recruited, and many of the Highland settlers were profoundly influenced by the evangelical movement. In Cape Breton, it culminated in a religious awakening of 1839-40, which, though more orderly and restrained, resembled in other ways the Great Awakening among Nova Scotia Congregationalists. Stanley's interpretation of this revival stresses the effects of emigration and re-settlement. In this sense, her work stands in the tradition of *A People Highly Favoured of God*, but, like Bumsted and now Rawlyk, she is careful not to reduce the religious experience of the settlers to the purely psychological plane. Thus she argues that intense religious experience helped them overcome anxiety and insecurity about their future but insists that this was not so much a "sublimated response" as a

14 For a survey of the historiography of the United Church of Canada, including the role of the Presbyterian dissidents, see N.K. Clifford, "The Interpreters of the United Church of Canada", *Church History*, XXXVI, 2 (June 1977), pp. 203-14.

15 A much less satisfactory work on Cape Breton Presbyterianism is Archibald D. MacKinnon, *The History of the Presbyterian Church in Cape Breton* (Antigonish, 1975). For Presbyterians on the mainland of Nova Scotia, there is little recent work beyond a few short items on Thomas McCulloch. See, for example, Marjory Whitelaw, *Thomas McCulloch: His Life and Times* (Halifax, 1985); Frank Baird, "A Missionary Educator: Dr. Thomas McCulloch", and V. Sharmen, "Thomas McCulloch's Stepsure: The Relentless Presbyterian", *Dalhousie Review*, LII, 4 (Winter 1972-73), pp. 611-17 and 618-25. See also Gordon Haliburton, *'For Their God': Education, Religion and the Scots in Nova Scotia* (Halifax, n.d.).



"positive assertion of faith". The theology of the revival, by emphasizing renewal and change, served to invest the settlers' new lives with a deeper meaning and sense of purpose. The fact that many of them remembered similar revivals in the Hebrides meant that religion also provided a reassuring link with the past.

Whereas *The Well-Watered Garden* is concerned with Scottish missionaries in Nova Scotia, another recent work deals largely with Nova Scotia missionaries in the West Indies. Graeme S. Mount's *Presbyterian Missions to Trinidad and Puerto Rico: The Formative Years, 1868-1914* (Hantsport, Lancelot Press, 1983) is a comparative study of the mission of Canadian Presbyterians to Trinidad and the labours of American Presbyterians in Puerto Rico. The Canadian mission was launched in 1868 by John Morton, a native of Pictou County and minister at Bridgewater, Nova Scotia. It was aimed principally at East Indian Hindus and Moslems who had arrived in Trinidad as indentured labourers to work on the sugar plantations. The American effort began 30 years later, at the conclusion of the Spanish-American War, and was directed at the native Roman Catholic population. Since the two stories are not directly connected, one has the feeling at times of reading two separate books. The comparative approach, however, does help to highlight certain key points. The Canadian and American missionaries had many common assumptions and objectives. Both were concerned not only to liberate people from religious error but also to improve their very poor social conditions. Yet they were also alike in that they naively attributed these conditions to false doctrines, ignoring almost entirely environmental considerations. Everything from violent crime to poor standards of public health was attributed by the missionaries to heathenism or to Roman Catholic superstition. Meanwhile, missionaries co-operated with the governing classes and remained largely uncritical of the social and economic systems, even to the point, in the case of Trinidad, of accepting the necessity of indentured labour. Nevertheless, to the extent that they imposed moral discipline on their converts and provided hospitals and schools, the Presbyterian churches exercised a constructive influence on society.

Mount takes a special interest in the question of racial bias among missionaries,<sup>16</sup> and on this point he discovers a significant difference between the Canadians and Americans. In his estimation, the Americans were generally more progressive in their attitudes and less committed to the cultural assimilation of their converts. They used Spanish in church records, for example, and made no formal distinction between American and native clergy; the Canadians, by contrast, recorded all proceedings in English and distinguished sharply between "ministers" and "native pastors". They also excluded East Indians from membership in the Mission council, which made all the crucial decisions for the church. These examples are striking, but the weakness in Mount's argument is

16 See also Graeme S. Mount and Joan E. Mount, "Bishop John Inglis and His Attitude toward Race in Bermuda in the Era of Emancipation", *Journal of the Canadian Church Historical Society*, XXV, 1 (April 1983), pp. 25-32, and Graeme S. Mount, "Maritime Methodists and Black Bermudians, 1851-1870", *Nova Scotia Historical Review*, IV, 2 (Fall 1984), pp. 39-50.

that the two groups of missionaries worked among very different populations. Whether the Americans would have been as tolerant of "coloured" and "heathen" immigrants as they were of the indigenous, largely white Christians of Puerto Rico is an open question. As for respecting the language of the converts, Mount himself points out that the status of Spanish in Puerto Rico was scarcely comparable to that of Hindi in Trinidad.

E. Arthur Betts, formerly Archivist of the Maritime Conference Archives, has made contributions to the history of all three denominations that formed the United Church of Canada in 1925. Since 1970, he has published a short history of Pine Hill Divinity Hall, a biographical register of Presbyterian clergy in the region up to 1875, and histories of both Methodism and Congregationalism in the Maritimes.<sup>17</sup> Like the older denominational histories, which they resemble in many respects, Dr. Betts' works have the merit of providing basic information on which future research can build. By themselves, however, they do not answer the need for sound histories of the dissenting churches. *Bishop Black and His Preachers*, 2nd edition (Halifax, Maritime Conference Archives, 1976) is Betts' most significant work; but it suffers considerably from trying to cover too much ground in a short space. This volume sketches the history of Methodism in the Maritimes from its origin to the formation of the Methodist Church of Canada in 1874. This period embraces many important changes, including Maritime Methodists' transfer of affiliation from the American Methodist Episcopal Church to the British Wesleyan Conference, as well as their eventual achievement of independence from England. Betts records these major events but makes a very limited attempt at interpretation. He also fails to provide an adequate account of Methodism in Newfoundland, to which Bishop Black made an historic visit in 1791. The chapter devoted to this topic simply reproduces entries from Black's journal. No mention is made of Lawrence Coughlan's pioneering ministry in Conception Bay or of the development of Newfoundland Methodism after Black's visit.<sup>18</sup> *Congregational Churches in Nova Scotia and New Brunswick: 1749-1925* (Sackville, N.B., Maritime Conference of the United Church of Canada, 1985) is an even more disappointing work. Although Betts provides biographical notes on clergymen and useful details about the development of local congregations, much of the book is taken up with a catalogue of churches and their ministers and with repetitive summaries of the annual meetings of the Congregational Union. The author misses the opportunity to shed light on topics of broader significance, such as the influence of the American Great Awakening on the Planters who brought Congregationalism to

17 E. Arthur Betts, *Pine Hill Divinity Hall, 1820-1970: A History* (Halifax, 1970), *Our Fathers in the Faith: Maritime Presbyterian Ministers* (Halifax, 1983).

18 For a fuller and in some respects more critical account of early Newfoundland Methodism, see Arthur E. Kewley, "The First Fifty Years of Methodism in Newfoundland: 1765-1815", *Journal of the Canadian Church Historical Society*, XIX, 1-2 (March-June 1977), pp. 6-26. On Coughlan, see also Patrick O'Flaherty, *The Rock Observed: Studies in the Literature of Newfoundland* (Toronto, 1979), pp. 22-6 and "Coughlan, Lawrence", *Dictionary of Canadian Biography*, IV, pp. 175-7.

Nova Scotia townships or the reasons why the representatives of Maritime Congregationalism voted unanimously to enter the United Church of Canada. Less than a page is devoted to the dramatic decline of Congregationalism at the end of the 18th century from its position as the largest Protestant denomination in Nova Scotia.

Only one full-length work on the Church of England has appeared in the last ten years. Thomas R. Millman and A.R. Kelley, *Atlantic Canada to 1900: A History of the Anglican Church* (Toronto, Anglican Book Centre, 1983) is based on research begun many years ago by Kelley and continued after his death by Millman. This book provides a straightforward survey, incorporating many well-known facts, but it offers little new information or original interpretation. This is decidedly institutional history, stressing the founding of congregations, the building of churches, the appointment of clergy, the erection of dioceses, the opening of schools and colleges, and the formation of church societies. There is no attempt to describe popular piety or to evaluate the impact of religion on people's lives.

A very significant topic which receives less attention than it deserves, especially in the early chapters, is the legal establishment of the Church of England. Little or no account is taken of the very influential idea that a strong church establishment was necessary to foster respect for authority and bolster loyalty to the Crown. The Church of England's special relationship to the state had a profound effect on the way Anglican clergy conceived of their role as well as on relations between Anglicanism and other denominations. The tensions that were engendered, however, are described mainly in retrospect, when the question of disestablishment is introduced. It is as though the topic was considered less provocative in this context. Moreover, in the discussion of disestablishment, the authors underestimate the Anglican clergy's resistance to reform. The impression is created, for example, that the Church Act of 1851, which finally disestablished the Church of England in Nova Scotia and which resulted in the Anglican bishop losing his seat on the council, met with little opposition. But on 7 August 1851, Bishop Binney sent a strongly worded appeal to the Colonial Secretary stating that "the most influential and respectable churchmen here are decidedly desirous that the Bishop should continue to sit in the Council" and also declaring that "the presence of the Bishop in the Council is particularly important just now, when so many attacks are made upon the Church and its property in the colony, and might possibly have some effect in impeding the passage of such Bills as that which we have lately petitioned Her Majesty to disallow".<sup>19</sup>

Millman and Kelley raise the important matter of Tractarian influences on 19th century Anglicanism in the Atlantic Region, as evidenced by Bishop Binney in Halifax and Bishop Medley in Fredericton; but for Newfoundland this topic is treated much more satisfactorily in a pamphlet by Frederick Jones, *Edward Feild, Bishop of Newfoundland, 1844-1876* (St. John's, Newfoundland

19 See John Moir, ed., *Church and State in Canada, 1627-1867: Basic Documents* (Toronto, 1967), pp. 69-70.

Historical Society, 1976).<sup>20</sup> Feild was a dedicated High Churchman, whose programme included making the colonial church financially independent from the state, strengthening episcopal authority, increasing the supply of clergy and building new churches in the neo-Gothic style. Jones describes these various endeavours succinctly and also sheds light on the question of sectarian strife in Newfoundland. He reckons that until Feild's arrival in 1844, conflict had been limited, partly because the Low Church, erastian and "pan-Protestant" Anglicans posed relatively little threat to the other denominations. With his High Church principles and uncompromising personality, however, Feild succeeded in dividing Anglicans and antagonizing Methodists and Roman Catholics, especially during the early years of his episcopate. Controversy erupted into violence on the occasion of the 1861 election, for which Jones blames not only Feild but also the Catholic bishop, John Mullock. He says that afterward clergy on both sides withdrew in horror from the political arena. Still, in 1875 Feild saw one of his chief goals realized when the education grant to Protestants was divided between Methodists and Anglicans, thus placing them on the same footing as Roman Catholics and setting the pattern for Newfoundland's unique system of denominational schools. Meanwhile, political patronage was also portioned out among the principal religious groups. Jones' view is that peace was established in Newfoundland not by weakening denominational allegiance but accepting such divisions and dividing privileges more or less equitably among the churches.

Finally, Judith Fingard has produced two fine articles on Protestant voluntary associations in British North America. One describes the career of Walter Bromley in Nova Scotia, while the other deals with the early work of the British and Foreign Bible Society.<sup>21</sup> Fingard focuses on the character of these humanitarian enterprises and their impact on colonial society, but her analysis also extends to such topics as relations within and between the various denominations. The British and Foreign Bible Society was supported by both Protestant dissenters and Anglican evangelicals, but generally opposed by High Church establishmentarians in the Church of England. Some surprising facts come to light, including the willingness of Alexander Macdonnell, Roman Catholic vicar-general for Upper Canada, to acquiesce in the Bible Society's distribution of French and Gaelic versions of the Scriptures among his flock. Such cases, how-

20 This should be read in conjunction with Frederick Jones, "Religion, Education and Politics in Newfoundland: 1836-1875", *Journal of the Canadian Church Historical Society*, XII, 4 (December 1970), pp. 63-76, "The Making of a Colonial Bishop: Feild of Newfoundland", *ibid.*, XV, 1 (March 1973), pp. 2-13, "The Early Opposition to Bishop Feild of Newfoundland", *ibid.*, XVI, 2 (June 1974), pp. 30-40. See also Frederick Jones, "The Church in Nineteenth Century Newfoundland", *Bulletin of Canadian Studies*, V, 1 (April 1981), pp. 25-39. For Bishop Medley and Tractarianism, see Robert L. Watson, *Christ Church Cathedral, Fredericton: A History* (Fredericton, 1984).

21 Judith Fingard, "English Humanitarianism and the Colonial Mind: Walter Bromley in Nova Scotia, 1813-1825", *Canadian Historical Review*, LIV, 1 (March 1973), pp. 123-50, and "Grapes in the Wilderness: The Bible Society in British North America in the Early Nineteenth Century", *Histoire sociale/Social History*, V, (No.9) (April 1972), pp. 5-31.

ever, do not obscure the anti-Catholic bias of the associations or the prevailing hostility of Catholics to their efforts. Fingard also remarks on the active participation of women in the Bible Society, which was in fact one of the first organizations to provide them with scope for public service. A similar observation applies to other voluntary church groups, as Wendy Mitchinson has shown in the case of missionary societies of the 19th century.<sup>22</sup> These bodies afforded women the chance not only to develop their talents for leadership and administration but also to expand their horizons beyond the local and domestic scenes.

Like Presbyterian and Methodist history, the story of English-speaking Roman Catholics in the Atlantic Region was for many years neglected. Most of the work on the topic was either outdated or extremely limited in scope.<sup>23</sup> The exceptions consisted of a few periodical articles, the most important of which dealt with Catholic emancipation.<sup>24</sup> In the last few years, however, there have been signs of progress. The confessional approach has been replaced by critical methodology and major collections of unpublished sources, in Ireland, Scotland, Quebec and Rome, have been exploited.

One of the first encouraging signs was an article by Raymond J. Lahey on the role of religion in Lord Baltimore's colony at Ferryland.<sup>25</sup> Until this essay appeared in 1977, even leading experts on the English colonies in Newfoundland had accepted the legend that Baltimore (then Sir George Calvert) had established this settlement as a haven for his fellow Roman Catholics. Lahey was able to show that Calvert's motives in launching the enterprise were originally commercial rather than religious, and that even when religion did enter the picture, Calvert did not envisage Ferryland as a "Catholic colony" but one in which adherents of different denominations could live peacefully side by side. Lahey's interpretation of events rests in part on documents he discovered in the Archives of the Sacred Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith. "Propaganda", as it is commonly called, was the department of the Roman Curia responsible for the Catholic Church in missionary countries or countries where the Church was subject to non-Catholic civil governments. It was created in 1622, a year after

22 Wendy Mitchinson, "Canadian Women and Church Missionary Societies in the Nineteenth Century: A Step Towards Independence", *Atlantis*, II, 2 (September 1977), pp. 57-75.

23 For example, see Cornelius O'Brien, *Memoir of the Right Rev. Edmund Burke* (Ottawa, 1894), M.F. Howley, *Ecclesiastical History of Newfoundland* (Boston, 1888), John C. MacMillan, *The History of the Catholic Church in Prince Edward Island*, 2 vols. (Quebec, 1905-13), A.A. Johnston, *History of the Catholic Church in Eastern Nova Scotia*, 2 vols. (Antigonish, 1960-71).

24 James Garner, "The Enfranchisement of Roman Catholics in the Maritimes", *Canadian Historical Review*, XXXIV, 3, (September 1953), pp. 203-18, Sister Mary Liguori, "Haliburton and the Uniackes: Protestant Champions of Catholic Liberty", *Canadian Catholic Historical Association Report*, 20 (1953), pp. 37-48, D.J. Rankin, "Lawrence Kavanagh", *ibid.*, 8 (1940-41), pp. 51-76.

25 Raymond J. Lahey, "The Role of Religion in Lord Baltimore's Colonial Enterprise", *Maryland Historical Magazine*, LXXII, 4 (1977), pp. 492-511. See also Raymond J. Lahey, "Avalon: Lord Baltimore's Colony in Newfoundland", in G.M. Story, ed. *Early Settlement and Exploitation in Atlantic Canada: Selected Papers* (St. John's, 1982).

the first settlers arrived at Ferryland, and among the earliest documents contained in its archives are letters from an English Discalced Carmelite, Simon Stock. Stock had served as chaplain to the Spanish Ambassador to England at the time that Calvert was involved in negotiations for the marriage of the Prince of Wales (later Charles I) to the Infanta of Spain. Stock claimed the credit for Calvert's conversion and from about 1624 he bombarded propaganda with requests to establish a Carmelite mission in Avalon. His requests are interesting not least of all because he saw Newfoundland as the gateway for Catholicism to the rest of the continent and indeed, through the Northwest Passage, to the Orient. Stock's grand design failed, but his correspondence with Roman officials sheds light not only on Calvert's settlement but also on perceptions of North America among European religious leaders of the 17th century.

Since Lahey's article appeared, Simon Stock's letters have been published by Luca Codignola of the University of Pisa in a volume entitled *Terre d'America e Burocrazia Romana: Simon Stock, Propaganda Fide e la colonia di Lord Baltimore a Terranova, 1621-1649* (Venice, Marsilio Editori, 1982). Approximately half of the book is devoted to an historical introduction by Codignola, while the balance is taken up with the letters. Codignola does not differ substantially from Lahey in his interpretation of events, but by publishing the original documents he enables us to see Stock's concern for Avalon in an even broader perspective. There are 93 letters in all, some of them transcribed in full, others summarized. Seventy-three come from the Archives of Propaganda, the rest from Carmelite Archives. Many are concerned with the faltering Carmelite mission in England, for which Propaganda also had responsibility. Stock's anxiety to see these missions placed on a stable footing was inseparably connected with his appeals for priests to be sent to Newfoundland. He wanted to strengthen the English mission partly so that English Catholics could rise to the challenge of the New World. A theme which runs through the letters is that Protestants had been quicker than Catholics to respond to missionary opportunities in America. Acutely conscious of developments in New England and Virginia, Stock feared that unless the Catholic Church acted promptly it would lose the battle for the continent. He was evidently not aware of French Catholic missions in Acadia or Quebec. Professor Codignola has done a very efficient job of presenting Stock's correspondence. References are clearly explained and a good index, together with a synoptic list of the documents, makes the volume easy to use.

Codignola's work on Stock is a by-product of a much larger project which has great significance for the study of Catholicism in French as well as English Canada. In 1977 he was retained by the Public Archives of Canada, working in conjunction with the Research Centre in the Religious History of Canada of Saint Paul University, to produce a calendar of all documents relating to Canada which are conserved in the Propaganda Archives. The inventory has now been completed for the period 1622 to 1799, and published as *Vatican: Archives of the Sacred Congregation 'De Propaganda Fide'* (Ottawa, Public Archives of Canada, 1983). Propaganda documents have been used before, especially for the

study of New France, but this is the first time that we have had a comprehensive survey of their contents relative to Canada. The value of the inventory is enhanced by the broad criteria of inclusion, which cover all documents relating to Canada regardless of their origin. This means that it extends to parts of French and British North America (such as Maryland and Louisiana) which did not become part of Canada and also includes several documents not directly concerned with North America but which may have affected Propaganda's American policy. The advantages of this approach show up in the material relating to the Capuchin mission in Acadia. The documents which Codignola includes allow us not only to follow events in Acadia but also to see them against the background of the bitter controversies which divided the order in France. Reservations about the value of the inventory may stem from the formal, repetitive character of many documents and from the fact that a number of them have been used previously. Codignola, however, has provided a systematic review of sources which furnishes a more comprehensive view than ever before. The advantages will be greater still when the project is carried into the 19th century, where both the quality and quantity of the material increase sharply.

Leaving aside Sir George Calvert's enterprise at Ferryland, the period in the history of English-speaking Catholics which has benefited most from recent research is the late 18th and early 19th centuries, when religious liberty was granted and the institutional foundations of the Catholic Church were laid in many areas. Cyril Byrne's *Gentlemen-Bishops and Faction Fighters: The Letters of Bishops O'Donel, Lambert, Scallan and Other Irish Missionaries* (St. John's, Jespersen Press, 1984) is concerned with Newfoundland during these years.<sup>26</sup> The volume consists of a selection from the correspondence of the first three Catholic bishops to serve in the colony, with additional documents which have a bearing on their careers. It is not difficult to understand why Byrne would choose to treat James Louis O'Donel, Patrick Lambert and Thomas Scallan together, for they had a great deal in common. All three were Franciscans, drawn from the social milieu of the "strong farmer" class in Ireland, and educated on the continent. All three likewise reflected the conciliatory, accommodating mood of Enlightenment Catholicism, before the Ultramontane revival ushered in a more aggressive approach. Still, O'Donel was so much more able and so much more important for the development of Catholicism in Newfoundland than his two successors that a case could be made that Byrne ought to have restricted the volume to his term of office. This would have allowed him to include all the relevant documents and, in particular, to give incoming as well as outgoing letters, many of which are readily available. O'Donel's correspondence with Bishop Plessis of Quebec, for instance, is fascinating, but we have here only one side of the exchange, in spite of the fact that copies of Plessis' letters are preserved in the Archives of the Archdiocese of Quebec. Nevertheless, Byrne's

26 Byrne has also translated a valuable document relating to the Maritimes: Cyril Byrne, "The Maritime Visits of Joseph-Octave Plessis, Bishop of Quebec", *Collections of the Nova Scotia Historical Society*, XXXIX (1977), pp. 23-47.

work is a valuable contribution to the field. It covers the crucial period from 1784 to 1829, and the documents included are consistently interesting. Byrne provides a lively introduction which helps to put the letters in context, and he also furnishes the reader with useful aids, including explanatory notes at the beginning of each letter and biographical information arranged alphabetically in an appendix.

Even more recent than Byrne's volume is an excellent short study by Raymond J. Lahey, *James Louis O'Donel in Newfoundland, 1784-1807: The Establishment of the Roman Catholic Church* (St. John's, Newfoundland Historical Society, 1984). This publication was commissioned by the Newfoundland Historical Society to celebrate the bicentenary of the formal establishment of the Roman Catholic Church in Newfoundland. Lahey manages to compress into a very short space a precise account of the main events of O'Donel's career. These include both ecclesiastical and constitutional developments, since O'Donel's appointment as Prefect (later Vicar) Apostolic is closely tied to the granting of religious liberty to Newfoundland Catholics. We are given a very clear account of O'Donel's efforts, in the face of considerable odds, to establish order among the Catholic population and to cultivate good relations with the civil authorities. One of the greater problems that he faced was the threat posed by irregular and rebellious clerics who found their way to Newfoundland, as they did to most North American colonies; but after years of conflict, he managed to bring even this problem under control. Lahey obviously admires O'Donel, but he presents a balanced picture, bringing out O'Donel's caution and conservatism as well as his qualities of leadership. He is well aware that O'Donel was a man of his time, who stood apart socially from the bulk of his flock, but he nevertheless shows that he had the best interests of his people at heart.<sup>27</sup>

The other Atlantic colonies have not fared as well as Newfoundland in research on English-speaking Catholics. One of the few studies which have appeared in recent years is Michael F. Hennessey, ed., *The Catholic Church in Prince Edward Island: 1720-1979* (Charlottetown, The Roman Catholic Episcopal Corporation, 1979). This collection covers Acadians as well as Irish and Scottish Catholics, but the most valuable paper is Francis Bolger's essay on Angus MacEachern, who served as the principal missionary in P.E.I. from 1790 and who became the first Bishop of Charlottetown in 1829. Bolger has used the Archives of the Archdiocese of Quebec as well as the Archives of the Scots College in Rome. His essay traces the gradual separation of Prince Edward Island from the jurisdiction of Quebec, a move which, like MacEachern himself, he

27 On O'Donel and the context of his career, see also Hans Rollmann, "John Jones, James O'Donel and the Question of Religious Tolerance in Eighteenth-Century Newfoundland; A Correspondence", *Newfoundland Quarterly*, LXXX, 2 (Summer 1984), pp. 23-7, and "Richard Edwards, John Campbell, and the Proclamation of Religious Liberty in Eighteenth-Century Newfoundland", *ibid.*, LXXX, 2 (Fall 1984), pp. 4-12. The first of these articles describes the harmonious relationship which developed between O'Donel and the Congregationalist minister at St. John's, while the second draws a revealing distinction between *de jure* and *de facto* toleration of Catholics in Newfoundland.



sees as essentially liberating.<sup>28</sup>

There has been only one major study of a Catholic leader of the later 19th century. This is Sister K. Fay Trombley's University of Louvain thesis, *Thomas Louis Connolly (1815-1876): the Man and His Place in Secular and Ecclesiastical History* (1983 [Distributed by Sister Genevieve Hennessey, Box 2266, Saint John, N.B. E2L 3V1]). Connolly came to the Maritimes as secretary to Bishop Walsh, who had just received his controversial appointment as co-adjutor to Bishop Fraser for the new Diocese of Halifax. He later served as Bishop of Saint John (1852-59) and Archbishop of Halifax (1859-1876). He profoundly influenced Maritime Catholicism by strengthening existing institutions and creating new ones. He also played an important part in the negotiations surrounding Confederation and was a prominent spokesman at the First Vatican Council, where he opposed the dogmatic definition of papal infallibility. He not only deserves but cries out for a full-length study, and there has been no shortage of scholars interested in working on his biography. The problem, however, is that some years ago the two main collections of his papers, one at Saint John and the other at Halifax, disappeared. Trombley, following in the footsteps of F. Wilson and David Flemming,<sup>29</sup> has tried to compensate by piecing together Connolly material from other collections. She has provided us with by far the fullest account of Connolly to date. Nevertheless, one still feels the lack of Connolly's papers, especially for shedding additional light on the motives behind his actions. Trombley is at times too confident in her favourable estimate of Connolly, given the fact that crucial information is missing. There seems to be no immediate prospect of recovering the lost documents, but for a truly satisfactory treatment of Connolly we will have to wait until they are found.

Several important studies have appeared in the last few years which shed new light on the background to English-speaking Catholicism in Atlantic Canada. Recent research into Irish Catholicism, for instance, has tended to dispel the notion that the typical Irishman of the 18th or early 19th century was a pious and dutiful Catholic. Sean Connolly has shown that in pre-famine Ireland semi-pagan customs often predominated over official Tridentine Catholicism.<sup>30</sup> David

28 A couple of journal articles have also appeared covering basically the same period for the Maritimes as a whole. One deals specifically with the career of James Jones, Superior of the Missions in the region from 1787 to 1800; the other describes the general development of Maritime Catholics from 1781 to 1830: Terrence Murphy, "James Jones and the Establishment of Roman Catholic Church Government in the Maritime Provinces", *Canadian Catholic Historical Association Study Sessions*, 48 (1981), pp. 26-42, and "The Emergence of Maritime Catholicism: 1781-1830", *Acadiensis*, XIII, 2 (Spring 1984), pp. 29-49. Further information about the separation of the lower colonies from the diocese of Quebec is contained in Lucien Lemieux, *L'Etablissement de la Première Province Ecclésiastique au Canada: 1783-1844* (Montreal, 1967).

29 F. Wilson, "The Most Reverend Thomas L. Connolly, Archbishop of Halifax", *Canadian Catholic Historical Association Report*, 11 (1943-44), pp. 55-108, David Flemming, "Archbishop Thomas L. Connolly: Godfather of Confederation", *Canadian Catholic Historical Association Study Sessions*, 37 (1970), pp. 67-84.

30 S.J. Connolly, *Priests and People in Pre-Famine Ireland: 1780-1845* (New York, 1982).

Miller has produced statistics to prove that church attendance was relatively low before 1845,<sup>31</sup> and Emmet Larkin has argued that many of the characteristics that we associate with Irish Catholicism are the result of a "devotional revolution" of the mid-19th century.<sup>32</sup> These conclusions are not accepted by all the experts in the field,<sup>33</sup> and one has to recognize at the very least that there were regional variations within Ireland. The districts which supplied the greatest number of immigrants to the Atlantic colonies were also the ones where official Catholicism had the strongest foothold. It is clear, however, that we have to guard against the glib assumption that Irishmen arriving in the Atlantic colonies were firmly attached to the Catholic Church and accustomed to regular religious observance.

The results of research into Scottish Catholicism have been much less dramatic, but two books have provided valuable background information. The first is Christine Johnson, *Developments in the Roman Catholic Church in Scotland: 1789-1829* (Edinburgh, John Donald, 1983). This work is narrower in focus than its title suggests, since it concentrates on the development of clerical education. Nevertheless, it includes some information about Catholic emancipation, Catholic ecclesiastical government in Scotland, and the position of Catholics in Scottish society. Also very helpful is J.M. Bumsted, *The People's Clearance: Highland Emigration to British North America, 1770-1815* (Winnipeg, University of Manitoba Press, 1982). This book is concerned with Scottish emigration to British North America between 1770 and 1815, and it treats religious circumstances only to the extent that they are related to the reasons for re-settlement. Still, it is of interest to religious historians because it illuminates the background, character and motives of Highland immigrants, both Catholic and Presbyterian. Furthermore, Bumsted was the first person to use the Scottish Catholic Archives for a Canadian topic, and it seems obvious from his results that they are a mine of information. Bumsted discovered among other things that the Highland emigration to Prince Edward Island led by John MacDonald of Glenaladale in 1772 was secretly supported by the Scottish Catholic bishops as a way of relieving the Catholics of South Uist from the threat of religious persecution.<sup>34</sup>

For the French-speaking portions of the Atlantic Region, the current phase of research began a few years earlier than for English-speaking groups. A landmark was achieved in 1967 with the publication of Lucien Campeau, *La Première mission d'Acadie (1602-1616)* (Quebec, Les Presses de l'Université Laval,

31 David W. Miller, "Irish Catholicism and the Great Famine", *Journal of Social History*, IX, 1 (Fall 1975), pp. 81-98.

32 Emmet Larkin, "The Devotional Revolution in Ireland, 1850-1875", *American Historical Review*, LXXVII, 3 (June 1972), pp. 625-52.

33 For a different view, see Desmond J. Keenan, *The Catholic Church in Nineteenth-Century Ireland: A Sociological Study* (Totowa, New Jersey, 1983).

34 On this point, see also J.M. Bumsted, "Highland Emigration to the Island of St. John and the Scottish Catholic Church: 1769-1774", *Dalhousie Review*, LVIII, 3 (Autumn 1978), pp. 511-27.

1967). This immense work appeared as the first volume of the *Monumenta Novae Franciae*, which is in turn part of the much larger *Monumenta Historica Societatis Jesu*, inaugurated in 1894. On the specific topic of early Jesuit missions in Acadia, Campeau's contribution is more accurate and complete than any previous work, including Reuben Gold Thwaites' famous edition of the *Jesuit Relations and Allied Documents*. It is a model of the scientific use of primary sources, consisting of 162 documents drawn from more than a dozen archives. Some of the sources had already been printed, others were previously unpublished. They vary considerably in length; the last item, which is Father Biard's crucial "Relation de la Nouvelle France", occupies nearly 200 pages. A formidable critical apparatus accompanies the documents, including a 25-page bibliography, 23 pages of biographical notes, a very detailed index, seven maps, and extensive annotations throughout the text. There is also an historical introduction of 221 pages. The introduction contains information about the climate, geography and native population of New France, much of which is redundant for Canadian readers; but it also includes a detailed account of the conflict which raged at Port Royal between the Jesuits and Charles de Biencourt, whose father had obtained the concession for the colony. This was the first in a long series of controversies between ecclesiastical and commercial interests in New France. It eventually became so divisive that the Jesuits withdrew from Port Royal to establish themselves at Saint-Saveur, only to be driven out shortly by the English. In assessing the conflict, Campeau, who is himself a Jesuit, comes down on the side of the missionaries, but not without presenting substantial arguments to support his case.<sup>35</sup>

The rest of the French régime has received only scant attention. Beyond Campeau's work, only a handful of articles have been produced in the last few years. Among these is a brief summary by Pierre Trépanier of the work of the Recollets in Acadia. Trépanier's essay is essentially an appeal for further research, especially in two areas; the financial aspects of the Recollet mission and the impact of the Recollets on the religious sensibility of the Acadians.<sup>36</sup> For the crucial period between 1713 and 1755, Micheline Dumont-Johnson has written a short book on the question of political agitation by Catholic missionaries.<sup>37</sup> She is critical of the missionaries in some respects but brings out the ambiguity of

35 See also Lucien Campeau, "La grande crise de 1612 à Port Royal", *Lettres du Bas-Canada*, XV (mars 1961), pp. 7-27, "Autour de la Relation du P. Biard", *Revue d'histoire de l'Amérique française*, VI, 4 (mars 1953), pp. 517-35. In 1972, Campeau published a much shorter account of the first Jesuit mission in Acadia: Lucien Campeau, *La Première Mission des Jésuites en Nouvelle-France: 1611-1613 et Les Commencements du Collège de Québec: 1626-1670*, vol. I in *Cahiers d'Histoire des Jésuites* (Montreal, 1972). This is based on the same sources and adds nothing substantial to what is set out in greatest detail in his earlier work. Nevertheless, it furnishes a convenient summary of events, especially for students.

36 Pierre Trépanier, "Les Récollets et l'Acadie (1619-1759): plaidoyer pour l'histoire religieuse", *Les Cahiers de la Société historique acadienne*, X, 1 (mars 1979), pp. 4-11.

37 Micheline Dumont-Johnson, *Apôtres ou agitateurs: la France missionnaire en Acadie* (Trois Rivières, 1970).

their situation more clearly than the mostly partisan writers who came before her. Meanwhile Gérard Finn has contributed a stimulating discussion of the historiography of the career of Abbé Le Loutre,<sup>38</sup> the central figure in this controversy, and Ephrem Boudreau has provided an outline of the work of Abbé Maillard,<sup>39</sup> the celebrated "apostle to the Micmacs". Antonio Dragon, *L'Acadie et ses 40 robes noires* is a popular history of Jesuit missions in Acadia up to 1773.<sup>40</sup>

A.J.B. Johnston has taken a step towards filling a considerable gap in our knowledge with his *Religion in Life at Louisbourg, 1713-1758* (Kingston and Montreal, McGill-Queen's University Press, 1984).<sup>41</sup> Johnston rightly points out that while much interest has been shown in the military, commercial, and social history of Louisbourg, its religious life has been largely neglected. He tries to remedy this situation by depicting the role of religion in relation to other aspects of Louisbourg society. His work grows directly out of the massive Parks Canada project at Louisbourg, in which he plays an important part; and one of the merits of the book is that he is able to turn this research to good account. For example, he uses the inventories of private libraries at Louisbourg as a guide to influence on religious thought and the method of dating wills as an indication of the importance of feast days in the life of the colony. A major weakness of the work, however, is that it is presented almost as a collection of discrete studies. Three of the five chapters are devoted to the religious orders which served at Louisbourg. Each is treated separately in its own domain of pastoral, medical or educational activities. An introductory chapter provides background material, and the fifth chapter describes the impact of religion on everyday life. Only the first chapter, by stressing the close connection between civil and religious society, tries to put this material in perspective. Much more could have been done to weave the various threads together and provide a more unified picture of religious life.

The history of the Acadian church after the exile has been comparatively well studied. This is due not only to the abundance of sources, but also to the conviction that the overall influence of religion on Acadian life increased sharply during this period. Interesting works have appeared on religion and education, religion and the economy, and religion and popular mores.<sup>42</sup> The turbulent relations

38 Gérard Finn, "Jean-Louis LeLoutre vu par les historiens", *Les Cahiers de la Société historique acadienne*, VIII, 3 (septembre 1977), pp. 108-47.

39 Ephrem Boudreau, "L'Abbé Maillard, Apôtre des Micmacs", *Les Cahiers de la Société historique acadienne*, IV, 5 (avril, mai, juin 1972), pp. 177-99.

40 Antonio Dragon, *L'Acadie et ses 40 robes noires* (Montreal, 1973).

41 See also A.J.B. Johnston, "Deux Recollets de l'Île Royale", *Province franciscaine Saint-Joseph du Canada Chroniques et Documents*, XXXVII, 1 (January 1984), pp. 1-8; Terry Crowley, "The Inroads of Secularization in Eighteenth-Century New France: Church and People at Louisbourg", *The Canadian Catholic Historical Association Historical Studies*, 51 (1984), pp. 5-27.

42 Alexandre Savoie, *Un Siècle des Revendications scolaires au Nouveau-Brunswick: 1871-1971*, 2 tomes (Montreal, 1978); Alexandre Savoie, "Les Communautés Religieuses et l'Enseignement au Nouveau-Brunswick depuis 1867", *La Société canadienne d'histoire de l'Eglise catholique*,

between Acadian and English-speaking Catholics and the impact of the church on nationalist ideology have also attracted considerable attention.<sup>43</sup> The most important recent study is undoubtedly Léon Thériault, "The Acadianization of the Catholic Church in Acadia: 1763-1953", which appeared as part of Jean Daigle, ed., *The Acadians of the Maritimes: Thematic Studies* (Moncton, Centre d'études acadiennes, 1982).<sup>44</sup> This long essay ought to be read in conjunction with Thériault's survey of post-conquest Acadian history in the same volume. The author very effectively relates the battle for "acadianization" of the church to the broader struggle for Acadian survival and self-determination. He also shows how the prestige and influence of the clergy increased with the rising tide of Acadian nationalism. In his view, the contrast between the periods before and after 1850 is very sharp. After the return from exile, the Catholic Church appeared to be the "only organized francophone element" in the Maritimes (p. 335). But the return of the Acadians was achieved without help from the church, and almost until the middle of the 19th century the laity resisted the authority of priests even in parish affairs. After 1850, the clergy exerted a powerful influence in secular as well as spiritual matters, managing to give a religious colouring to a wide range of nationalist undertakings such as newspapers, colleges, hospitals and cooperatives. They were active, for example, in the campaign against emigration to New England, which they portrayed as not only unpatriotic but almost sinful, inasmuch as it was associated with materialism. Thériault does not, however, share Michel Roy's harsh judgement of the Acadian clergy as a "class of petty imperialists in cassocks",<sup>45</sup> which he says is based on inadequate research.

A large portion of Thériault's essay is devoted specifically to the bitter struggle of the Acadians to gain control over the government of their own church. There are a few minor inaccuracies in his account of the formation of Maritime

*Sessions d'Etude*, 48 (1981), pp. 67-78; Georgette Desjardins, "Les Religieuses Hospitalières de Saint-Joseph, éducatrices au Madawaska depuis 1873", *ibid.*, pp. 57-66; Alphonse Deveau, "La Religion et l'Economie dans les Milieux Acadiens", *Revue de l'Université Sainte-Anne* (1983), pp. 18-26; Léon Thériault, "Les Missionnaires et leur paroissiens dans le Nord-Est de Nouveau-Brunswick: 1766-1830", *Revue de l'Université de Moncton*, IX, 1-3, (octobre 1976), pp. 31-52; Catherine Jolicœur, "La vie religieuse des Acadiens à travers leur croyances traditionnelles", *La Société canadienne d'histoire de l'Eglise catholique, Sessions d'Etude*, 48 (1981), pp. 79-87; Lauraine Leger, *Les Sanctions Populaires en Acadie* (Montreal, 1978).

43 Mason Wade, "Relations between the French, Irish and Scottish Clergy in the Maritime Provinces: 1774-1836", *Canadian Catholic Historical Association Report*, 39 (1972), pp. 9-33, M.S. Spigelman, "Race et religion: les Acadiens et la hierarchie catholique irlandaise du Nouveau-Brunswick", *Revue d'histoire de l'Amérique française*, XXIX, 1 (juin 1975), pp. 69-85; Anselme Chiasson, "Le clergé et le reveil acadien: 1864-1960", *Revue de l'Université de Moncton*, XI, 1 (février 1978), pp. 29-46; Fernand Arsenault and Edmour Babineau, "Mgr. Philippe Belliveau et l'identité acadienne", *ibid.*, XIV, 2 (mai-juillet 1981), pp. 103-47.

44 First published as *Les Acadiens des Maritimes: Etudes Thématiques* (Moncton, 1980).

45 Michel Roy, *L'Acadie perdue* (Montreal, 1978), p. 60, as quoted in Thériault, "Acadianisation", p. 334.

dioceses,<sup>46</sup> but these are of a technical nature and do not affect the substance of his argument. As the Catholic Church developed in the region, it was dominated by Irish and Scots. Of the 17 bishops appointed for the Maritimes between 1817 and 1900, not one was French-speaking, let alone Acadian. With the Acadian Renaissance of the late 19th and early 20th centuries, this ecclesiastical discrimination became a major issue. Acadians pressed to have one of their own nominated as a bishop; the Irish and Scottish hierarchy resisted the pressure. Both sides made representations to Rome, and provocative comments appeared in the press. When attempts to get an Acadian bishop failed, the focus shifted to appeals for an Acadian diocese. A breakthrough came when Edouard Le Blanc was appointed Bishop of Saint John in 1912. A second Acadian, Patrice-Alexandre Chiasson, was named to Chatham in 1920, and the diocese was transferred to Bathurst in 1938. In 1936, a new Acadian diocese was erected at Moncton. Yarmouth followed in 1953. Thériault's summary of these events is presented from the Acadian perspective, but not in a way that undermines its scholarly character. One crucial dimension of the story, however, — Rome's handling of the affair — cannot be told in full until the Vatican Archives are opened beyond the present limit of 1903.

Two important works have dealt with Christian missions among Canadian Indians. Cornelius Jaenen, *Friend and Foe: Aspects of French-Amerindian Cultural Contact in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries* (1976)<sup>47</sup> was a detailed and penetrating study of the encounter between European and native cultures which brought out admirably the complexity and ambiguity of this experience. Although Jaenen dealt with all of New France, many of his examples were drawn from events in Acadia, and his conclusions apply as much to this region as to Quebec.

John Webster Grant's recent study, *Moon of Wintertime: Missionaries and the Indians of Canada in Encounter since 1534* (Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 1984) is broader in scope, covering Catholic and Protestant missions in Canada from the 16th to the 20th century. Grant provides an engaging and readable narrative as well as a sensitive analysis of the problems raised by cultural contact. This topic is too complex and controversial for any one treatment to command complete agreement, but Grant's approach is a balanced one, neither naive nor cynical in describing missionary methods or the reasons for conversion. Grant recognizes that conversion to Christianity usually went hand in hand with other forms of affiliation with Europeans, but even more important in his view is that mass movements to Christianity among native people were associated with the breakdown of traditional society, brought on in part by contact with outsiders. The threat to native customs cannot be laid entirely at the

46 For example, he says on p. 286 that the dioceses of Kingston and Charlottetown were founded in 1819, whereas the correct dates are 1826 and 1829 respectively. In 1819, the principal clergymen of these regions, A. Macdonnell and A. MacEachern, were consecrated as bishops but continued for the time being to serve as vicars-general to the Bishop of Quebec.

47 Toronto, McClelland and Stewart, 1976.

door of the missionaries, for they were only part of a broader pattern of European intervention. A nagging question to which Grant returns repeatedly is whether in attempting to improve Indian society the missionaries unwittingly helped to destroy it. Not until the middle of the 20th century did the churches begin to overcome the idea that in order to "Christianize" the native people they had also to assimilate them to the white man's culture.

Like Jaenen's book, Grant's work contains valuable material concerning the Atlantic Region. Outstanding missionaries such as Jessé Fleché, Pierre Biard, Chrestien LeClerq, Pierre Maillard, Thomas Wood, Walter Bromley, and Silas Rand are all mentioned at least briefly. Grant also compares one region to another, suggesting for example, that for the Micmacs more than any other Canadian Indians Christianity was a source of tribal solidarity. Developments in the Atlantic Region, however, are described mainly for the period before 1800. In the 19th and 20th centuries, Grant's attention shifts to the North and West, the areas of missionary expansion. For specific studies of missions among the native peoples of Atlantic Canada, we have to turn once again to periodical literature. Judith Fingard's article on Walter Bromley, already mentioned, deals partly with his work among the Indians. Helen Ralston has added a survey of church and state policies toward the education of Micmacs, showing that while these policies changed in other respects they remained until very recently essentially assimilationist.<sup>48</sup>

So much remains to be done in the religious history of the Atlantic Region that it is difficult to set a precise agenda. Three general points, however, deserve special consideration. The first is the fact that the tendency so far has been to concentrate on certain formative stages of development at the expense of periods during which less dramatic but nevertheless important changes took place. Apart from the early Jesuit missions, for example, religion under the French régime is known almost entirely from outdated secondary sources. Much the same applies to the English-speaking churches at a later date. The crucial developments of the late 18th century have been studied closely, but subsequent events have been largely ignored. There is an obvious need to carry the story of Anglicans, Protestant dissenters and English-speaking Catholics into the 19th century. Even relations between the various churches are imperfectly understood.<sup>49</sup> As for non-Christian groups, a few short items on Jews in Atlantic Canada have appeared recently, but this entire field is still in its infancy.<sup>50</sup>

48 Helen Ralston, "Religion, Public Policy and the Education of the Micmac Indians of Nova Scotia: 1605-1872", *Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology*, XVIII, 4 (November 1981), pp. 470-98.

49 A.J.B. Johnston, "Popery and Progress: Anti-Catholicism in Mid-Nineteenth-Century Nova Scotia", *Dalhousie Review*, LXIV, 1 (Spring 1984), pp. 146-63 is a welcome contribution to this topic, but much more research remains to be done.

50 David S. Zlatin, *The Administrative History of the Jewish Community in St. John's: Synagogue and Education* (St. John's, 1978); M.M. Lazar and Sheva Medjuck, "In the Beginning: a Brief History of the Jews in Atlantic Canada", *Canadian Jewish Historical Society Journal*, 5 (Fall 1981), pp. 91-108.

More work also needs to be done on the influence in Atlantic Canada of national or international currents. E.R. Forbes has shown how accounts of such movements in Canada are likely to omit or misinterpret developments in the Atlantic Region when told from a Central Canadian perspective.<sup>51</sup> Forbes himself had gone some way toward redressing the balance with a good essay on the social gospel in Nova Scotia,<sup>52</sup> but unfortunately nothing further has been published on this topic. We need major studies not only of the Social Gospel, but also of the evangelical movement of the 19th century and of Ultramontanistism among Catholics.<sup>53</sup> We can also benefit from seeing well-known local developments in a broader context, as Gregory Baum's *Catholics and Canadian Socialism* (1980) illustrates with respect to the Antigonish Movement.<sup>54</sup>

Finally, we must continue to extend the compass of research beyond mere ecclesiastical history. A knowledge of the internal development of the churches is essential, but one of the most fruitful tendencies in current research is the desire to understand the influence of religion on the behaviour of the general population. The methodological problems here are formidable but, as a few exemplary works have demonstrated, not insurmountable. It is only by devising means of evaluating popular religious customs and attitudes that we will be able effectively to relate the history of the churches to the social development of the region.

TERRENCE MURPHY

51 E.R. Forbes, review of Richard Allen, *The Social Passion: Religion and Social Reform in Canada, 1914-1928* (Toronto, 1971), in *Acadiensis*, II, 1 (Autumn 1972), pp. 94-9.

52 E.R. Forbes, "Prohibition and the Social Gospel in Nova Scotia", *Acadiensis*, I, 1 (Autumn 1971), pp. 11-36. See also Clifford Rose, *Four Years with the Demon Rum*, with an introduction by E.R. Forbes and A.A. MacKenzie (Fredericton, 1980).

53 The question of ultramontane influences has been raised in a limited manner in Frederick Jones, "Bishops in Politics: Roman Catholic v. Protestant in Newfoundland, 1860-2", *Canadian Historical Review*, LV, 4 (December 1974), pp. 408-21.

54 Gregory Baum, *Catholics and Canadian Socialism: Political Thought in the Thirties and Forties* (Toronto, 1980).

## The French Canadian and Acadian Diaspora

IN RECENT YEARS historians and social scientists using a variety of methods and sources have rediscovered tiny islands of French settlement throughout North America. A review of some of the latest works dealing with these communities reveals two major approaches to the study of French minorities outside Québec and New Brunswick. It seems that Canadian students of the French Canadian and Acadian diaspora stress the importance of language in their studies of the French communities in English Canada. This emphasis is hardly surprising